Teacher Performance Evaluation Based on a Holistic Approach to Improve Education Quality at SMP Muhammadiyah 57

Syarifuddin Nasution
Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara
ariefnast@gmail.com
Amiruddin Siahaan
Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara
amiruddin.siahaan@gmail.com
Khairuddin
Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara
khairuddin@uinsu.ac.id

Abstract

Evaluation is the initial process for planning the way forward. Still, in practice, it was found that most teacher performance evaluation programs did not positively impact the quality of education. This study describes the strategic planning, organisational structure, and implementation outcomes of the teacher performance evaluation programme at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 Medan. Data were collected using interviews, observation, and document analysis, and validated by triangulation using a qualitative descriptive approach. Strategic planning, supported by specific objectives, standardised procedures, and professional development efforts, emerged as the main approach to the program's success, according to the findings. This high-level assessment combined national policy objectives with a region-specific approach, blending theoretical models with realities on the ground. An organisational model detailed how systematic implementation was carried out, assigning responsibilities to evaluators and administrators. However, limited teacher involvement in developing evaluation instruments and unclear communication of results were identified as remaining problems, resulting in dissatisfaction and mismatched expectations. This study highlights the importance of collaborative planning, transparent feedback mechanisms, and evaluator training to build trust and improve program effectiveness. The study provides a comprehensive model of teacher assessment through self-evaluation, motivational incentives, and strong regulation, which allows for practical applications to support educational institutions in improving assessment processes and enhancing teaching quality.
Keywords: Teacher performance evaluation; strategic planning; holistic model.

Introduction

Teacher performance evaluation is one of the main components in improving the quality of education. Good teacher performance can significantly impact student learning outcomes. Schleicher states that teacher professional development and planned evaluation are key to improving education quality.[1] Performance evaluation also ensures teachers meet predetermined competency standards, including pedagogical, professional, social, and personality competencies.[2]

Teacher performance evaluation planning at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 has been well-systematized since the school's inception. This aligns with the concept of strategic planning in education management proposed by Bryson, where good planning includes clear objectives, standardised procedures, and accountable evaluation formats.[3] In previous research, Darling-Hammond emphasised the importance of goal-based planning that measures performance and supports continuous professional development.[4]

The organisation of the teacher performance evaluation, which involves various elements, such as the principal, deputy principal, and Majelis Dikdasmen, illustrates the coordination and clear division of tasks. According to Mintzberg, an effective organisational structure in the education system requires strong coordination among all parties to achieve common goals.[5] This organisation also aligns with Hasibuan's theory regarding the importance of a clear division of tasks in improving work effectiveness.[6]

Implementing performance evaluation at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 uses a self-assessment approach and discussion with the evaluator team. Research by Rachel Roegman states that self-assessment methods can increase teachers' awareness of their competencies and encourage professional development.[7] However, obstacles such as the

---

[1] Andreas Schleicher, "Teaching Excellence through Professional Learning and Policy Reform," *Lessons from Around the World, International Summit on the Teaching Profession* 2, no. 2 (2016): 406–15.

[2] Republik Indonesia, "Permendiknas No. 16 Tahun 2007 Tentang Standar Kualifikasi Akademik Dan Kompetensi Guru," *Jakarta: Seketariat Negara*, 2007.

[3] John M Bryson, "Strategic Planning," in *Defining Public Administration* (Routledge, 2018), 208–29.

[4] L Darling-Hammond, "Effective Teacher Professional Development," *Learning Policy Institute*, 2017.

[5] Henry Mintzberg, Daniel J McCarthy, and Constantinos Markides, "View from the Top: Henry Mintzberg on Strategy and Management [and Commentary]," *The Academy of Management Executive (1993-2005)*, 2000, 31–42.

[6] Nasruddin Hasibuan, "Pengembangan Pendidikan Islam Dengan Implikasi Teknologi Pendidikan," *Fitrah: Jurnal Kajian Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman* 1, no. 2 (2016): 189–206.

[7] Rachel Roegman et al., "Unpacking the Data: An Analysis of the Use of Danielson's (2007) Framework for Professional Practice in a Teaching Residency Program," *Educational Assessment, Evaluation and Accountability* 28 (2016): 111–37.

lack of teacher involvement in preparing the assessment format can hinder the effectiveness of this program.

Researchers have long been concerned about learning evaluation. For example, Widodo's research highlights the role of school culture in supporting holistic education development at SD Muhammadiyah Sleman, Yogyakarta.[8] In addition, John & Bhamwari's research examines the evaluation of holistic education, emphasising the continuous development of cognitive, psychomotor, and affective dimensions to improve the quality of education.[9] On the other hand, research on applying basic teaching skills at Muhammadiyah Soni South Dampal Junior High School shows that a holistic approach can improve teacher professionalism through effective methods such as lectures, discussions, and assignments.[10] Subadi's research on lesson study-based training models for Muhammadiyah primary school teachers in Kartasura has also proven effective. Lesson study, through collaborative and interactive evaluation between principals, teachers, and working groups, results in creative and innovative learning.[11]

While the holistic approach is a common thread across these studies, the primary focus differs. Your research, which evaluates teacher performance holistically as the primary variable, can complement previous studies. Providing practical insights into the direct impact of teacher performance on education quality contributes to a more comprehensive understanding of improving learning quality.

The study will explore the teacher performance evaluation program at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 to ensure the achievement of evaluation objectives. This supervision includes reviewing the assessment format, identifying obstacles, and deliberating to resolve problems. This research contributes to the literature on education management by showing how teacher performance evaluation can be effectively designed, organised, implemented, and supervised at the school level.

---

[8] Hendro Widodo, "The Role of School Culture in Holistic Education Development in Muhammadiyah Elementary School Sleman Yogyakarta.," *Dinamika Ilmu* 19, no. 2 (2019): 265–85.

[9] Jeenu John and Varmala T Bhamwari, "Evaluation in 21st Century: A Holistic Approach," *Voice of Research* 5, no. 4 (2017): 17–18.

[10] N Asia, "Penerapan Keterampilan Dasar Mengajar Guru Di SMP Muhammadiyah Soni Dampal Selatan," *Scolae* 2, no. 1 (2019): 253–61.

[11] Tjipto Subadi, Sabar Narimo, and Erlina Farida Hidayati, "Based Learning Training Lesson Study to Improve the Quality of Elementary School Teachers Kartasura Muhammadiyah, Indonesia," *Warta LPM*, 2022, 1–9.

Research Methodology

This research uses a descriptive qualitative approach to provide an in-depth understanding of implementing the teacher performance evaluation program.[12] This method focuses on extracting data in a natural context to understand the observed phenomenon. This approach allows research to describe the process, interaction, and results of implementing teacher performance evaluation by referring to the direct experience of the research subject.

The research was conducted in a junior secondary education setting, focusing mainly on teacher performance evaluation. The research subjects included principals, teachers, the evaluator team, and other parties implementing the evaluation program. The selection of locations and subjects was based on relevance to the research context, ensuring that the data collected reflected real practices.

Data was collected using interviews, observation, and document analysis techniques. Interviews were conducted using an open-ended approach to gain an in-depth understanding of the research subjects' perceptions and experiences. Observations were performed directly in the field to capture the dynamics of the evaluation implementation process, including the interactions and working patterns of the evaluator team. In addition, evaluation formats, results reports, and related policies were analysed to complement the data obtained from interviews and observations.

Data analysis was conducted using a qualitative descriptive approach, which began with organising the data into thematic categories. The data was analysed to identify patterns, themes, and relationships between phenomena relevant to the research focus. This process involved grouping information based on themes, presenting the data in narrative form, and interpreting the results by linking them to relevant theories. This analysis aims to provide a detailed picture of the implementation of teacher performance evaluation.[13]

This research uses triangulation techniques regarding sources, methods, and data to ensure data validity. Source triangulation was done by comparing interviews, observations, and document data. The process of triangulation was used by combining

---

[12] Sugiyono, *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan* (Bandung: Alfabeta, 2019).
[13] Analisis Data Emzir, "Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif," *Jakarta: Rajawali Pers*, 2011.

various data collection techniques. In addition, the participants checked the results of the interviews and data analysis again to ensure the accuracy of the interpretation.

Teacher Performance Evaluation Planning as a Strategic Component in Improving Education Quality

Planning is an essential element of the management cycle and a key determinant of the success of an evaluation program. As asserted by Mintzberg[14] and Bryson,[15] Effective strategic planning should include clear objectives, standardised procedures, and accountable evaluation formats. At SMP Muhammadiyah 57, teacher performance evaluation planning has been systematically conducted since the school's inception. This system is outlined in a Joint Working Agreement (KKB) document that details the objectives, procedures, and guidelines for conducting the evaluation. This step demonstrates the implementation of organization-based strategic planning, which aligns with the idea that strategic planning provides a framework for institutions to achieve efficiency and effectiveness.[16]

The performance evaluation program at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 is designed to thoroughly assess teachers' competencies, improve their professional performance, and map teachers' abilities in various aspects. In addition, this evaluation is complemented by a periodic coaching program to ensure continuous quality improvement. This is in line with Darling-Hammond's research,[17] This evaluation program emphasises the key to improving education quality: goal-based planning supported by continuous professional development. Thus, it is an assessment that provides direction for teacher development through an approach focusing on comprehensive quality improvement.

The evaluation instrument used, the 'teacher report card,' was designed by the principal and a team of evaluators and endorsed by the Majelis Dikdasmen. This step reflects the application of systematic evaluation, which involves periodic review to ensure conformity with set objectives. This approach is supported by Arikunto's guidelines, which emphasise that evaluation should be an integral part of supervision and continuous

---

[14] Henry Mintzberg, *Structure in Fives: Designing Effective Organizations.* (Prentice-Hall, Inc, 1993).

[15] John M Bryson, *Strategic Planning for Public and Nonprofit Organizations: A Guide to Strengthening and Sustaining Organizational Achievement* (John Wiley & Sons, 2018).

[16] Bryson, "Strategic Planning."

[17] Darling-Hammond, "Effective Teacher Professional Development."

improvement.[18] This system draws on evaluation theory and incorporates practice elements relevant to educational institutions.

The assessment indicators in the teacher performance evaluation include professional, competency, and coaching aspects, which are aligned with the pedagogical, professional, social, and personality competency standards as stipulated in Permendiknas No. 16/2007[19] The emphasis on these indicators shows that SMP Muhammadiyah 57 seeks to integrate theory and practice to improve the quality of education. In line with competency theory, this approach provides a systematic foundation for identifying areas that require intervention and ensuring alignment with national education policies.

Findings: This study makes an essential contribution in corroborating previous findings regarding the role of strategic planning and performance evaluation in the educational context. For example, the findings support Bryson's view that strategic planning is essential in achieving organisational efficiency. It also reinforces Darling-Hammond's idea that well-planned professional development can significantly improve the quality of education. By combining national policies and locally-based approaches, this study offers a model of evaluation practices that other institutions can adapt to enhance educators' performance.

Overall, the planning and implementation of teacher performance evaluation at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 contribute to the existing literature by presenting a holistic approach that links evaluation theory with practical implementation. This model can serve as a reference for other educational institutions in developing evaluation programs that are more systematic, measurable, and oriented towards improving the quality of education.

Organising Teacher Performance Evaluation at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 Medan

The evaluation program at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 is organised through a structured division of tasks based on management theory, emphasising the importance of coordinating and delegating tasks to achieve work efficiency. The principal acts as the primary evaluator, with support from the deputy heads of curriculum, infrastructure, and student affairs. Each deputy head has specific responsibilities relevant to aspects of

---

[18] Suharsimi Arikunto, *Dasar-Dasar Evaluasi Pendidikan Edisi 3* (Bumi aksara, 2021).
[19] Indonesia, "Permendiknas No. 16 Tahun 2007 Tentang Standar Kualifikasi Akademik Dan Kompetensi Guru."

teacher performance assessment. Such an organisation creates a clear structure and ensures that all aspects of the evaluation are addressed with the proper focus.

This approach reflects the implementation of Mintzberg's theory, which states that an effective organisational structure requires coordination between actors to achieve common goals. For example, the deputy head of curriculum is responsible for assessing teachers' professional aspects, such as lesson planning and curriculum implementation. In contrast, the deputy head of student affairs assesses teachers' competence in student guidance. A well-directed division of tasks can make the evaluation process more comprehensive and in-depth.

However, one of the main challenges in organising evaluation at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 is the lack of teacher involvement in developing assessment instruments. This often leads to different perceptions between evaluators and evaluated teachers. As Fullan explains, involving all parties in the planning of an evaluation program is essential in increasing ownership and commitment to program implementation. By involving teachers in the early stages, such as the preparation of evaluation indicators, alignment between the expectations of evaluators and teachers can be better ensured so that the evaluation process becomes more objective and well-received.

The organisation of teacher performance evaluation at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 is essential for corroborating previous theoretical and empirical views. First, the findings support Mintzberg's view that an effective organisational structure requires coordination and clear task division to achieve efficiency and program success.[20] Second, the findings enrich Fullan's research, emphasising the importance of multi-stakeholder involvement in educational programs. Thus, this study offers an implementation model of evaluation organisation that can be used as a reference for other academic institutions to overcome the challenge of aligning perceptions between evaluators and teachers.[21]

The structured organisation based on the division of tasks allows for a more systematic and thorough evaluation of teacher performance. However, teachers' involvement as an integral part of the evaluation process must be improved to ensure program sustainability. This can be achieved through workshops or focus group

---

[20] Mintzberg, *Structure in Fives: Designing Effective Organizations.*
[21] Michael Fullan, "Three Keys to Maximizing Impact" (Jossey-Bass and Ontario Principal's Council, Toronto, 2014).

discussions involving teachers in developing evaluation instruments. This approach increases transparency and builds mutual trust between evaluators and teachers.

Implementation of Teacher Performance Evaluation at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 Medan

The implementation of teacher performance evaluation at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 is systematically designed and conducted once a year based on a pre-arranged plan. The process involves a *self-assessment* method, where teachers are asked to evaluate themselves before discussing their evaluation with the evaluator team. This approach reflects the principles proposed by Danielson, who emphasises that *self-assessment* can increase teachers' awareness of their competencies and motivate them to continue developing through deep self-reflection.[22] This method also allows teachers to contribute actively to the evaluation process, thus creating a sense of ownership of the results.

One of the successes of this evaluation is the high level of teacher motivation created through the provision of rewards such as salary and position increases for the best-performing teachers. This is based on Charlotte Danielson's theory of motivation, which explains that external factors such as rewards (motivators) play a significant role in increasing job satisfaction and individual performance.[23] Applying this theory to the context of performance evaluation at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 shows how rewards can be a strategic tool to encourage educators' optimal performance.

However, implementing this performance evaluation still faces obstacles, especially regarding communicating evaluation results to teachers. This constraint has led to dissatisfaction with the evaluation program because some teachers feel that the assessment results are not transparently conveyed or are not accompanied by clear directions for improvement. This aligns with Fullan's research, emphasising that effective communication and constructive feedback are essential in implementing evaluation programs. Open communication increases satisfaction with the evaluation process and provides concrete guidance for teachers to improve the quality of their performance.

This study reinforces previous theoretical and empirical views regarding implementing *self-assessment-based* performance evaluation and the influence of external motivation on performance. The *self-assessment* approach supports Danielson's

---

[22] Charlotte Danielson, *The Framework for Teaching Evaluation Instrument.*, 2013.
[23] Robert J House and Lawrence A Wigdor, "Herzberg's Dual-Factor Theory of Job Satisfaction and Motivation: A Review of the Evidence and a Criticism.," *Personnel Psychology* 20, no. 4 (1967).

idea that self-reflection can effectively increase awareness and professional development. In addition, using rewards as a motivator aligns with Herzberg's theory, which proves that external motivation can create job satisfaction and increase productivity.

The barriers to communication of evaluation results also contribute to Andy Hargreaves' research, which states that the success of evaluation programs depends not only on technical implementation but also on the effectiveness of communication and feedback. As such, this study adds insight into how performance evaluation implementation can be optimised through improving the transparency and quality of interactions between evaluators and teachers.[24]

To overcome communication barriers, it is recommended that SMP Muhammadiyah 57 adopt a solution-based feedback strategy that involves open discussions between evaluators and teachers. Training evaluators to provide specific, clear, and constructive feedback can be essential to improving evaluation programs' effectiveness. Thus, performance evaluation can become a more effective tool to drive improvements in the quality of teaching in schools.

Supervision of Teacher Performance Evaluation at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 Medan

Supervision of the teacher performance evaluation program at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 is integral to ensuring the evaluation's objectives are achieved and identifying obstacles during its implementation. In Ihwan Mahmudi's view, supervision has two main functions: preventive, to prevent potential problems before they occur, and repressive, to deal with issues that have already happened to avoid further impact.[25] Muhammadiyah 57 Junior High School adopts these two functions by reviewing the annual evaluation format and deliberations involving various stakeholders to find solutions to the problems.

This school's approach reflects the importance of monitoring as a managerial instrument to ensure program sustainability and effectiveness, as described by Kerem Toker. Reviewing the evaluation format annually ensures that the evaluation instrument remains relevant to the school's needs and changing regulations.[26] In addition,

---

[24] Andy Hargreaves and Michael Fullan, *Professional Capital: Transforming Teaching in Every School* (Teachers College Press, 2015).

[25] Ihwan Mahmudi, "CIPP: Suatu Model Evaluasi Program Pendidikan," *At-Ta'dib* 6, no. 1 (2011).

[26] Kerem Toker and Dilaysu Cinar, "Mintzberg's Adhocratic Organization Structure," in *Globalization and Governance in the International Political Economy* (IGI Global, 2014), 319–33.

implementing deliberation encourages active participation from all parties, creating a space to discuss emerging challenges and find consensus-based solutions.

One main obstacle in the supervision process is the lack of alignment between the evaluators' evaluation parameters and the evaluated teachers' perceptions. This mismatch not only hampers the objectivity of the evaluation but can also reduce teacher satisfaction with the program. Fullan emphasises the importance of involving all stakeholders, including teachers, in developing evaluation instruments to improve the accuracy and fairness of the evaluation process. By involving teachers, their perceptions of evaluation fairness and transparency can be improved, which in turn can encourage their active participation in performance quality improvement efforts.

To improve the effectiveness of supervision, SMP Muhammadiyah 57 could consider strengthening communication mechanisms in deliberations, including using tools such as surveys or interviews to collect teacher feedback in a structured manner. In addition, training for evaluators on aligning evaluation parameters with teachers' needs could be a strategic step to minimise potential perception mismatches in the future. Thus, supervision is an administrative and strategic step to build a culture of continuous improvement in schools.

Conclusion

The supervision of teacher performance evaluation at SMP Muhammadiyah 57 Medan revealed a *holistic engagement-based* supervision strategy model structured through a combination of preventive and repressive functions. The novelty of this research lies in the collaborative approach to developing evaluation parameters, which involves teachers as active partners, thus creating evaluation instruments that are more adaptive and relevant to local needs. The annual review of the evaluation format and the implementation of deliberations aim to ensure program effectiveness and serve as a dynamic mechanism to overcome barriers, including the perception gap between evaluators and teachers.

The main implication of this research for national education policy is the importance of implementing the collaboration-based supervision model on a broader scale. This approach reinforces the theory of supervision as a critical element in improving education quality by emphasising the empowerment of local actors through effective communication, evaluator training, and an integrated feedback collection

system. In addition, this research shows that supervision that is not only control-oriented but also a strategic tool to support continuous improvement can create a more inclusive educational environment that is responsive to the needs of students and educators.

As a policy measure, it is recommended that the Ministry of Education and Culture first adopt a supervision model based on teacher participation in preparing evaluation instruments to improve ownership and evaluation accuracy. *Second*, evaluator competency training should be enhanced to ensure a uniform understanding of evaluation parameters based on a holistic approach. *Third*, annual deliberation mechanisms and formal feedback collection should be integrated into the national evaluation system for continuous improvement. With these findings-based policies, evaluation monitoring will be a control tool and a foundation for transforming education towards a higher quality and equitable system in Indonesia.

Bibliography

Arikunto, Suharsimi. *Dasar-Dasar Evaluasi Pendidikan Edisi 3*. Bumi aksara, 2021.

Asia, N. "Penerapan Keterampilan Dasar Mengajar Guru Di SMP Muhammadiyah Soni Dampal Selatan." *Scolae* 2, no. 1 (2019): 253–61.

Bryson, John M. "Strategic Planning." In *Defining Public Administration*, 208–29. Routledge, 2018.

———. *Strategic Planning for Public and Nonprofit Organizations: A Guide to Strengthening and Sustaining Organizational Achievement*. John Wiley & Sons, 2018.

Danielson, Charlotte. *The Framework for Teaching Evaluation Instrument*, 2013.

Darling-Hammond, L. "Effective Teacher Professional Development." *Learning Policy Institute*, 2017.

Emzir, Analisis Data. "Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif." *Jakarta: Rajawali Pers*, 2011.

Fullan, Michael. "Three Keys to Maximizing Impact." Jossey-Bass and Ontario Principals' Council, Toronto, 2014.

Hargreaves, Andy, and Michael Fullan. *Professional Capital: Transforming Teaching in Every School*. Teachers College Press, 2015.

Hasibuan, Malayu S P. "Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia," 2008.

Hasibuan, Nasruddin. "Pengembangan Pendidikan Islam Dengan Implikasi Teknologi Pendidikan." *Fitrah: Jurnal Kajian Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman* 1, no. 2 (2016): 189–206.

House, Robert J, and Lawrence A Wigdor. "Herzberg's Dual-Factor Theory of Job Satisfaction and Motivation: A Review of the Evidence and a Criticism." *Personnel Psychology* 20, no. 4 (1967).

Indonesia, Republika. "Permendiknas No. 16 Tahun 2007 Tentang Standar Kualifikasi Akademik Dan Kompetensi Guru." *Jakarta: Seketariat Negara*, 2007.

John, Jeenu, and Varmala T Bhamwari. "Evaluation in 21st Century: A Holistic Approach." *Voice of Research* 5, no. 4 (2017): 17–18.

Mahmudi, Ihwan. "CIPP: Suatu Model Evaluasi Program Pendidikan." *At-Ta'dib* 6, no. 1 (2011).

Mintzberg, Henry. *Structure in Fives: Designing Effective Organizations*. Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1993.

Mintzberg, Henry, Daniel J McCarthy, and Constantinos Markides. "View from the Top: Henry Mintzberg on Strategy and Management [and Commentary]." *The Academy of Management Executive (1993-2005)*, 2000, 31–42.

Roegman, Rachel A. Lin Goodwin, Rebecca Reed, and Randolph M Scott-McLaughlin. "Unpacking the Data: An Analysis of the Use of Danielson's (2007) Framework for Professional Practice in a Teaching Residency Program." *Educational Assessment, Evaluation and Accountability* 28 (2016): 111–37.

Schleicher, Andreas. "Teaching Excellence through Professional Learning and Policy Reform." *Lessons from Around the World, International Summit on the Teaching*

Profession 2, no. 2 (2016): 406–15.

Subadi, Tjipto, Sabar Narimo, and Erlina Farida Hidayati. "Based Learning Training Lesson Study to Improve the Quality of Elementary School Teachers, Kartasura Muhammadiyah, Indonesia." *Warta LPM*, 2022, 1–9.

Sugiyono. *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan*. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2019.

Toker, Kerem, and Dilaysu Cinar. "Mintzberg's Adhocratic Organization Structure." In *Globalization and Governance in the International Political Economy*, 319–33. IGI Global, 2014.

Widodo, Hendro. "The Role of School Culture in Holistic Education Development in Muhammadiyah Elementary School, Sleman, Yogyakarta." *Dinamika Ilmu* 19, no. 2 (2019): 265–85.