

Abd al-Fattāḥ al-Qāḍī's Critique of Ignác Goldziher's Thought on Qirā'āt: Its Implications for Qirā'āt Learning in Islamic Education Institutions

Moḥ. Hudal Hafid Ilmi

Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel Surabaya
hudalhafidz@gmail.com

Ari Azḥar Yusuf

Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel Surabaya
ariazharyusuf@gmail.com

Aḥmad Fauzan Zaḥri

Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel Surabaya
fauzanalanwari@gmail.com

Corresponding Author: Moḥ. Hudal Hafid Ilmi

Article history: Received: August 23, 2024 | Revised: October 23, 2024 | Available Online: Desember 14, 2024

Abstract

This study discusses Ignác Goldziher's criticism of qirā'āt (variations in Qur'anic recitation) and its implications for Islamic education. Orientalist criticism, including Goldziher's view, emphasises that the diversity of qirā'āt is due to the weakness of early Arabic orthography that lacks dots and harakat, so it is considered a product of human improvisation, not a divine provision. This criticism raises doubts about the authenticity of the Qur'an and has a significant impact on the younger generation of Muslims if not responded to with scientific arguments. This study aims to analyse 'Abd al-Fattāḥ al-Qāḍī's thoughts as a critical response to Goldziher's views, as well as explore its implications in strengthening the teaching of qirā'āt in Islamic educational institutions. This research uses a qualitative method with a library research approach. Primary data is taken from Goldziher's *Madhāhib al-Tafsīr al-Islāmī* and *al-Qirā'āt fī Naẓr al-Mushtashiqīn wa al-Mulḥidīn* by 'Abd al-Fattāḥ al-Qāḍī, as well as other supporting literature. The results show that Goldziher's critique is ahistorical and ignores the talaqqī system and mutawātir sanad in the Islamic tradition. In contrast, al-Qāḍī asserts that the variations in qirā'āt are varied, not contradictory, and have wisdom in facilitating the understanding of the Qur'an. This study recommends integrating traditional and critical academic approaches into the Islamic education curriculum. The traditional approach emphasises memorisation and talaqqī, while the critical approach equips students with scientific abilities to respond to orientalist criticism. This research makes a significant contribution in filling the gap of previous descriptive research and offering practical solutions for strengthening qirā'āt education in facing the challenges of orientalist thought.

Keywords: Qirā'āt, Ignác Goldziher; Orientalist Criticism; 'Abd al-Fattāḥ al-Qāḍī; Islamic Education.

Introduction

The Qur'an has become one of the main focuses in Islamic studies among Muslim scholars and orientalists. In the context of Qur'anic studies, qirā'āt is part of the intellectual heritage of Islam, and it also plays a vital role in teaching the Qur'an in Islamic educational institutions, ranging from madrasas and Islamic boarding schools to universities. However, in its development, qirā'āt has become an object of criticism from orientalists, such as Ignác Goldziher,¹ Arthur Jeffery,² and Régis Blachère,³ Who questioned the authenticity and authority of qirā'āt as part of divine revelation.⁴

The phenomenon of orientalist criticism of the Qur'an indirectly affects Qur'anic learning in the Islamic world. Goldziher, an orientalist from Hungary, in his work *Die Richtungen Der Islamischen Koranauslegung*,⁵ Goldziher, a Hungarian orientalist, in his work *Die Richtungen Der Islamischen Koranauslegung*, argues that the diversity of qirā'āt is due to the limitations of the early Arabic writing system that did not recognise dots and harakat. This opinion, according to Goldziher, opened space for improvisation of recitation by the imam qurrā', so he considered qirā'āt not tawqīfī (derived from the Prophet Muhammad PBUH) but ijtihādī.⁶ This criticism was later reinforced by orientalists such as Arthur Jeffery, who stated that the variation of qirā'āt is a form of inconsistency of the Qur'an,⁷ Régis Blachère also attributed the diversity of readings to the influence of non-Arabic elements in the early Islamic period.⁸

According to Muhammad Muzayyin, these criticisms have a significant impact, especially in Islamic education. The younger generation of Muslims who study the Qur'an through qirā'āt may experience confusion or even lose faith in the authenticity of the

¹ Ignác Goldziher, *Die Richtungen Der Islamischen Koranauslegung*, vol. 6 (Brill Archive, 1920).

² Arthur Jeffery, "Eclecticism in Islam," *The Muslim World* 12, no. 3 (1922): 230–47.

³ Régis Blachère, "Regards Sur Un Passage Parallèle Des Evangiles et Du Coran," in *Mélanges d'islamologie* (Brill, 1974), 69–73.

⁴ M Suud, "Amsal Al-Qur'an: Sebuah Kajian Dalam Psikologi Pendidikan Islam," *Fikrotuna: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Manajemen Islam* 05, no. 01 (2017).

⁵ Goldziher, *Die Richtungen Der Islamischen Koranauslegung*.

⁶ Lena Salaymeh, "Deutscher Orientalismus Und Identitätspolitik: Das Beispiel Ignaz Goldziher," *Tel Aviver Jahrbuch Für Deutsche Geschichte* 45 (2017).

⁷ Ahmad Sanusi Azmi, "Kritikan Orientalis Terhadap Keaslian Bahasa Al-Quran: Analisis Terhadap Teori Perkataan Asing Dalam Al-Quran: Orientalist's Criticism on The Language of The Quran: An Analysis on The Theory of Foreign Vocabulary in The Quran," *Ma'ālim Al-Qur'ān Wa Al-Sunnah* 15, no. 2 (2019): 93–108.

⁸ Moh Isom Mudin, "Sejarah Kodifikasi Mushaf Utsmani: Kritik Atas Orientalis & Liberal," *Tasfiyah: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 1, no. 2 (2017): 305–42.

Qur'an if these criticisms are not responded to with systematic scientific arguments.⁹ The urgency of Islamic education in responding to orientalist criticism is becoming increasingly important, not only to maintain people's belief in the authenticity of the Qur'an but also to equip students with a deep and critical understanding of the science of qirā'āt.¹⁰ In this context, the contributions of scholars like 'Abd al-Fattāḥ al-Qāḍī become relevant as a scholarly response to the thoughts of Goldziher and other orientalists. Through monumental works such as *al-Qirā'āt fī Naẓr al-Mushtashriqīn wa al-Mulḥidīn*, al-Qāḍī managed to provide a methodological rebuttal to the allegations of orientalists.¹¹

This research starts with two main problems. *First*, there is still a methodological gap in the scholarly response to orientalist criticism of qirā'āt, especially Ignác Goldziher's thought. Although there have been many studies of orientalist criticism of qirā'āt, most previous studies are still limited to argumentative rejection without a more systematic and contextual approach in Islamic education. *Secondly*, no references explore the implications of orientalist criticism on the learning of qirā'āt in Islamic educational institutions. This issue is crucial in developing tafsir and qirā'āt curriculum in the contemporary era.

Mohamad Fathur Rozi's article *The Existence of Qur'anic Qiraat (Critical Study of Ignaz Goldziher's Thought)* answers Ignaz Goldziher's criticism with Linguistic theory.¹² However, this research is only a rebuttal that has not offered concrete solutions to the teaching of qirā'āt in Islamic educational institutions. Ecky Syahrullah, in his article, evaluates Goldziher's thought. However, this study still fails to link the criticism with its impact on qirā'āt education among students.¹³ Akhmad Roja Badrus Zaman, responds to Arthur Jeffrey in *Questioning Orientalist Criticism of Qirā'āt*. Unfortunately, this study focuses more on textual rebuttals than their implications for the teaching of qirā'āt.

This study offers a comprehensive analysis of Ignác Goldziher's critique from the perspective of 'Abd al-Fattāḥ al-Qāḍī while examining its implications for qirā'āt

⁹ Muhammad Muzayyin, "The Qur'ān According to Orientalist Views (An Analytical Study of the 'Theory of Influence' in Orientalist Thought)," *Journal of Qur'ānic and Hadith Studies* 16, no. 2 (2015): 203-21.

¹⁰ Makki Makki, "Epistemologi Pendidikan Islam: Memutus Dominasi Barat Terhadap Pendidikan Islam," *Al-Musannif* 1, no. 2 (2019): 110-24.

¹¹ Abd al-Fattāḥ Al-Qāḍī, *Al-Qira'at Asy-Syazzah Wa Taujihuha Min Lugah Al-'Arab* (Bairut: Dar al-Kitab al-., Arabi, 1981).

¹² Mohamad Fathur Rozi, "Eksistensi Qiraat Al-Qur'an (Studi Kritis Atas Pemikiran Ignaz Goldziher)," *SUHUF* 9, no. 1 (2016): 123-40.

¹³ Ecky Syahrullah, "Kritik Atas Kritik Ignaz Goldziher Tentang Qirā'āt," *Al-Itqan: Jurnal Studi Al-Qur'an* 3 (2017): 118-38.

education in Islamic educational institutions. This focus on education is essential to identify curriculum solutions that can strengthen learners' understanding of qirā'āt and fortify them against the influence of orientalist criticism.

Research Methodology

This research uses a qualitative approach with a library research method.¹⁴ This approach was chosen because the research aims to analyse Ignác Goldziher's thoughts on qirā'āt as well as the criticism of his thoughts proposed by 'Abd al-Fattāḥ al-Qāḍī. The primary sources used in this research are Goldziher's *Madhāhib al-Tafsīr al-Islāmī* and *al-Qirā'āt fī Naẓr al-Mushtashriqīn wa al-Mulḥidīn* by al-Qāḍī. In addition, this research also utilises supporting literature such as books, journal articles, previous research results, and other relevant scientific works. To ensure the validity of the data, the references used are taken from reliable sources that can be accessed through digital platforms such as Scopus, Google Scholar, and Web of Science.

The data in this study were obtained by identifying, collecting, processing, and analysing relevant literature.¹⁵ The first stage describes Goldziher's critique of qirā'āt, where each argument, such as the limitations of the Arabic writing system and the claim of improvisation of the imam of qurrā', is comprehensively explained based on primary sources. Furthermore, al-Qāḍī's work is used to examine and refute these criticisms. Al-Qāḍī's approach of emphasising the validity of qirā'āt through the concepts of tawqīfī, sanad, and refutation of orientalist views is critically analysed.

Furthermore, the data is analysed using descriptive-analytical methods, which describe the phenomenon under study systematically and objectively.¹⁶ The researcher describes the findings of orientalist criticism in detail, then relates them to al-Qāḍī's response to understand how he defended the authenticity of qirā'āt. In addition, this study also evaluates the implications of orientalist criticism for the teaching of qirā'āt in Islamic educational institutions. With this approach, the study is expected to significantly contribute to strengthening the qirā'āt curriculum, particularly in equipping learners with a more comprehensive and argumentative understanding of the issues raised by

¹⁴ Sugiyono, *Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, Dan R&D*, ed. Alfabeta (Bandung, 2019).

¹⁵ Lexy J. Moleong, *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif* (PT. Remaja Rosdakary., 2004).

¹⁶ S Pd Rukin, *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif* (Yayasan Ahmar Cendekia Indonesia, 2019).

orientalists. This research also fills a void in previous studies that have not fully highlighted the educational aspect as a solution to respond to criticism of qirā'āt.

Orientalist Definitions and Their Relation to Qirā'āt

Orientalism is a study with long historical roots, beginning with the interaction between the West and the East in trade, politics, and intellect. Etymologically, the term "orientalism" comes from the words *orient* (east) and *ism* (flow or understanding), which refers to the study of the East from a Western perspective.¹⁷ In his work *Orientalism*, Edward Said defines Orientalism as a method for the West to understand the East, which is often hegemonic and biased.¹⁸ This mainly includes Islamic studies, where orientalists attempt to represent Islamic teachings, including the Qur'an and qirā'āt, based on Western frameworks.

In the context of qirā'āt, some orientalists such as Ignác Goldziher, Arthur Jeffrey, and Theodor Nöldeke paid great attention to the variation of the Qur'anic recitation. They often questioned the authenticity of the Qur'an, attributing the diversity of qirā'āt to the absence of periods and harakat in the initial writing of the Mushaf. These views are not neutral and are often influenced by historical prejudices and the methodologies they use, such as the textual criticism approach commonly used in Biblical studies.¹⁹ Despite its academic contribution to uncovering the history of text writing, Orientalist criticism often does not consider the oral transmission and sanad aspects that are the foundation of Islamic qirā'āt studies.

Ignác Goldziher's View on Qirā'āt

Ignác Goldziher is one of the most influential orientalists who highlighted the aspect of qirā'āt in the Qur'an. In his work *Madhāhib al-Tafsīr al-Islāmī*, Goldziher argues that the variations in the recitation of the Qur'an are caused by:²⁰

1. Characteristics of Early Arabic Writing: Goldziher states that the absence of periods and harakat in the early period allowed different readings. An example is the difference in reading in Qs. *al-A'rāf*: 48 between (تَسْتَغْرِوْنَ) and (تَسْتَكْبِرُونَ).

¹⁷ Hasani Ahmad and W O Mardiyah Nur Batubara, "Orientalisme Dan Oksidentalisme: Kajian Keotentikan Al-Qur'an," *Al-Bayan: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Hadist* 5, no. 2 (2022): 206–25.

¹⁸ Edward W Said, "Orientalism," in *Social Theory Re-Wired* (Routledge, 2023), 362–74.

¹⁹ Rohanda Rohanda and Dian Nurrachman, "Orientalisme vs Oksidentalisme: Benturan Dan Dialogisme Budaya Global," *Jurnal Lektur Keagamaan* 15, no. 2 (2017): 377â – 389.

²⁰ Goldziher, *Die Richtungen Der Islamischen Koranauslegung*.

2. Textual Chaos: According to Goldziher, qirā'āt causes the Qur'an to be inconsistent; hence, he calls it a "chaotic" text. This view denies the qirā'āt transmission system that is guaranteed through mutawātir sanads.
3. Attempts to Unify the Mushaf: Goldziher argues that 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān attempted to unify the Mushaf by burning other Mushafs. He ignored the real purpose of codification, which was to preserve mutawātir readings and avoid readings that had become *mansūkh*.

Goldziher also equated the Biblical method of textual criticism with his approach to the Qur'an, which resulted in erroneous generalisations. He ignored the fact that qirā'āt is not based on writing alone but on the traditions of talaqqī and mushāfahah (oral transmission) that have a continuity of sanad up to the Prophet.²¹

'Abd al-Fattāḥ al-Qāḍī's Critique of Goldziher's Thought

In response to Goldziher's criticism, 'Abd al-Fattāḥ al-Qāḍī through his work *al-Qirā'āt fī Naẓr al-Mushtashriqīn wa al-Mulḥidīn* provides a comprehensive scientific rebuttal. Al-Qāḍī asserts that the diversity of qirā'āt is a varied phenomenon, not contradictory.²² He explains that differences in recitation take two forms:

1. Variations of Lafaz with the Same Meaning: For example, the phrase (الصراط) can be read as ṣād or sīn, which aims to facilitate Muslims with different dialects.
2. Lafaz Variations with Different but Not Contradictory Meanings: The words (نُنشِرُهَا) and (نُنشِرُهَا) have complementary meanings, which shows the breadth of meaning in the Qur'an.

In addition, al-Qāḍī refutes Goldziher's claim regarding 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān's attempt to unify the Mushaf. According to him, the act was not to eliminate variations in recitation but rather to preserve the mutawātir qirā'āt from mansūkh recitations. Al-Qāḍī also emphasised that the writing of the Mushaf during 'Uthmān's time was accompanied by the transmission of qurrā' that ensured the recitation according to the narrations, not just a free interpretation of the Mushaf's rhyme.

In response to Goldziher's views on ancient Arabic writing, al-Qāḍī asserts that qirā'āt does not depend on writing alone. The transmission of Qur'anic recitation is based

²¹ Rudi Wahyudi, "Kritik Terhadap Qira'ah Al-Qur'an Perspektif Orientalis," *TAFAKKUR: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir* 2, no. 1 (2021): 49–62.

²² Al-Qāḍī, *Al-Qira'at Asy-Syazzah Wa Taujihuha Min Lughah Al- 'Arab*.

on the talaqqī tradition with a mutawātir sanad, distinguishing it from Western textual criticism approaches. Thus, differences in qirā'āt are not a product of imperfect writing but rather part of Allah's wisdom in making it easier for Muslims to learn and understand the Qur'ān.²³

Implications for Qirā'āt Education

Fitria Apriyani sees that Goldziher's and other orientalists' criticisms of qirā'āt have profound implications for Islamic education. Young Muslims who do not understand the scientific arguments behind qirā'āt may be influenced by the doubts spread by Orientalist criticism.²⁴ In this regard, the thoughts of 'Abd al-Fattāḥ al-Qāḍī become a vital foundation to strengthen the understanding of qirā'āt in the Islamic education curriculum. Emphasis on mutawātir sanad and talaqqī should be prioritised in teaching qirā'āt in madrasas, Islamic boarding schools, and Islamic universities.

With this approach, students will not only understand the variation of readings as part of God's grace but also be able to respond to criticisms raised by orientalists with strong scientific arguments. This research confirms that strengthening qirā'āt education is a solution to maintain academic integrity and people's belief in the authenticity of the Qur'an.

Critical Analysis and Its Impact on Islamic Education

Ignác Goldziher's and other orientalists' criticism of qirā'āt has had a profound impact on the understanding of Muslims, especially in education.²⁵ Young Muslims, as the object of Islamic education, are often confronted with discourses that question the authenticity of the Qur'an and the diversity of readings contained in qirā'āt. This criticism, if not responded to appropriately, can instil doubts about the integrity of the Qur'an, especially among young academics who lack understanding of the methodology of qirā'āt transmission.²⁶ In this context, it is essential to link 'Abd al-Fattāḥ al-Qāḍī's thoughts with efforts to strengthen the Islamic education curriculum based on scientific and contextual methodologies.

²³ Al-Qāḍī.

²⁴ Fitria Apriyani et al., "Kritik Al-Maraghi Atas Pendapat Ignaz Goldziher Dalam Buku Introduction To Islamic Theology And Law," *TAJDID: Jurnal Ilmu Ushuluddin* 22, no. 1 (2023): 52–77.

²⁵ Abdul Karim, "Pemikiran Orientalis Terhadap Kajian Tafsir Hadis," *Addin* 7, no. 2 (2015).

²⁶ Ade Pahrudin, "Pengaruh Orientalis Goldziher Dalam Studi Hadis Kontemporer Di Indonesia," *Refleksi* 20, no. 1 (2021): 49–72.

Ignác Goldziher, in his work *Madhāhib al-Tafsīr al-Islāmī*, suggests that the variation in qirā'āt is due to the weakness of early Arabic orthography, which lacked dots and harakat.²⁷ This view is reinforced by the assumption that variations in Qur'anic recitation arose due to human improvisation, not as part of the tawqīfī (divine provision) that rests on the Prophet's narration. Goldziher's opinion, despite receiving academic attention in the West, had a significant impact on the world of Islamic education.

In education, an approach that does not understand the tradition of sanad and talaqqī can confuse students. As stated by Lailatul Maskhuroh,²⁸ Orientalist criticism tends to be accepted rawly by Muslim academics if it is not balanced with a critical-analytical approach that emphasises the validity of qirā'āt transmission through mutawātir sands.²⁹ Such criticism creates epistemological problems in understanding the Qur'an and qirā'āt, thus demanding a comprehensive effort in Islamic education to address this issue.³⁰

The Contribution of 'Abd al-Fattāḥ al-Qāḍī's Thought as a Solution

In his work *al-Qirā'āt fī Naẓr al-Mushtashriqīn wa al-Mulhidīn*, 'Abd al-Fattāḥ al-Qāḍī provides a systematic critique of Goldziher's views. Al-Qāḍī explains that the variations in the recitation of the Qur'an are not contradictory or "chaotic", as Goldziher claims. Still, they are varied and facilitate people's reading and understanding of the Quran. The two main points of al-Qāḍī's thought that are relevant to Islamic education are as follows:

1. Qirā'āt Differences as a Mercy, Not a Discrepancy

The differences in qirā'āt in lafaz and meaning do not lead to theological or textual contradictions. On the contrary, these variations enrich people's understanding of the meaning of the Qur'an. For example, there is a difference in reading in Qs. al-A'rāf/7: 48 between تَسْتَكْبِرُونَ (you boast) and تَسْتَكْثِرُونَ (you multiply) have complementary meanings. This approach shows that differences in the recitation of

²⁷ (Goldziher, 'Abd al-Halīm Najjār, & Najjār, 1983).

²⁸ Lailatul Maskhuroh, "Implikasi Hermeneutik Al Qur'an Dalam Epistemologi Islam," *Urwatul Wutsqo: Jurnal Studi Kependidikan Dan Keislaman* 9, no. 2 (2020): 261–74.

²⁹ Fitriah M Suud, "Pendidikan Kedamaian Di Era Digital (Telaah Model Forgiveness Dalam Psikologi Islam)," *Fikrotuna* 7, no. 1 (2018): 694–716.

³⁰ Muhammad Abdul Ghofur, "Sejarah Dan Dinamika Perkembangan Wacana Kronologi Al-Qur'an Kaum Orientalis," *AN NUR: Jurnal Studi Islam* 16, no. 1 (2024): 164–78.

qirā'āt are not a product of error but part of divine wisdom in making it easier for people to understand the Qur'an.³¹

2. Mutawātir Sanad as Validation of Qirā'āt

Al-Qāḍī asserts that qirā'āt is based on talaqqī and mutawātir sanad, which makes it part of the oral tradition that maintains its authenticity. This contrasts the orientalist approach that focuses only on written texts and ignores the oral transmission process established in the Islamic tradition. As revealed by Gade (2018) in *The Qur'an and Its Study*, the oral tradition in the Qur'an plays a central role in maintaining the text's authenticity and reading of the Qur'an.

This contribution of al-Qāḍī's thought has practical relevance in Islamic education. Integrating an understanding of sanad and the history of qirā'āt into the curriculum of tafsir and Qur'anic studies can equip students with epistemological tools to respond to orientalist criticism scientifically and argumentatively.

Integration of Research Findings in the Islamic Education Curriculum

This study offers a practical solution to the orientalist critique by proposing an integrative learning model in qirā'āt education. This model includes two main approaches:

1. Traditional Approach

Emphasising talaqqī (oral learning) and memorisation of qirā'āt as the primary methods for understanding the variations in Qur'anic recitation. This approach should be complemented by an emphasis on sanad and mutawātir narrations, as explained in Makki's study,³² Which emphasises the importance of the validity of history in maintaining the authenticity of the recitation of the Qur'an.

2. Critical-Academic Approach

Equip learners with a critical understanding of orientalist methodologies, such as the textual criticism approach used in Biblical studies. Learners need to be taught that these methods cannot be applied to the Quran because of their different transmission methods. For reference, Sarwar Haidari³³ States that textual criticism methods are often reductionist if applied without understanding the context of Islamic tradition.

³¹ Zainal Arifin Madzkur, "Al-Rasm Al-'Uthmānī Fī Al-Muṣḥaf Al-Mi 'yārī Al-Indūnīsī 'inda Al-Dānī Wa Abī Dāwud," *Studia Islamika* 27, no. 1 (2020): 103–43.

³² Makki, "Epistemologi Pendidikan Islam: Memutus Dominasi Barat Terhadap Pendidikan Islam."

³³ Sarwar Haidari, "Exploring Consciousness Through the Qur'an: A Philosophical Inquiry," *QiST: Journal of Quran and Tafseer Studies* 3, no. 2 (2024): 234–80.

Through these two approaches, the younger generation of Muslims can understand qirā'āt as part of Islam's intellectual heritage that is preserved while being able to respond to orientalist criticism with systematic and academic arguments. In addition, this study makes significant contributions in several aspects: *first*, it offers a practical solution by integrating traditional and academic learning models in qirā'āt education. This complements previous studies that tend to be descriptive, such as research like Saifuddin Duhri's³⁴ *Second*, it emphasises the importance of mutawātir sanad epistemology as a scientific response to orientalist criticism, as analysed in Mufidah Zahro's research.³⁵ *Third*, it provides an argumentative basis that can be implemented in the Islamic education curriculum to build students' critical understanding of qirā'āt while maintaining their belief in the authenticity of the Qur'an.³⁶

Conclusion

This article highlights Ignác Goldziher's and other orientalists' critique of qirā'āt in the Qur'an, which has significant implications for Islamic education, especially in building young Muslims' understanding of the authenticity of the Qur'an. Criticism that emphasises the weakness of early Arabic orthography and ignores the talaqqī transmission system and mutawātir sanad has created an epistemological gap that can be exploited by sceptical discourse. This study confirms that Goldziher's approach is incompatible with Islamic methodology that places sanad and history as the main pillars in maintaining the authenticity of qirā'āt.

In response, the thought of 'Abd al-Fattāḥ al-Qāḍī through his work *al-Qirā'āt fī Naẓr al-Mushtashriqīn wa al-Mulḥidīn* provides a strong scientific argumentation in refuting the orientalist view. Al-Qāḍī shows that the diversity of qirā'āt is not a form of inconsistency but rather part of Allah's grace that enriches Muslims' understanding of the meaning of the Qur'an. He also emphasised the importance of talaqqī and mutawātir sanad as the basis for validating qirā'āt, which makes the differences in recitation a varied aspect, not contradictory.

³⁴ Saifuddin Duhri, "The Representation of God in Acehnese Qur'an Translation: Wahhabi-Salafi Translations of Anthropomorphic Verses and the Verdict on Heresy," in *Qur'an Translation in Indonesia* (Routledge, 2024), 60–76.

³⁵ Mufidah Zahro and Anisa Maulidya, "Qur'anic Recitation Varieties: Recognizing Qira'at as a Spiritual Tradition," *Jurnal Studi Ilmu Alquran Dan Tafsir* 1, no. 1 (2024).

³⁶ Fuad Nawawi, "Argumentasi Kemutawatiran Qira'at Sab 'Ah," *SUHUF* 17, no. 1 (2024): 23–41.

This study suggests integrating traditional and critical academic approaches in the qirā'āt curriculum in Islamic education. Traditional approaches, such as talaqqī and memorization-based teaching, ensure the preservation of mutawātir sands. In contrast, critical-academic approaches equip learners to understand and respond scientifically to orientalist criticism. This strategy not only fortifies the younger generation from doubts but also strengthens the belief in the authenticity of the Qur'an through valid arguments.

The contribution of this research lies in combining practical and theoretical approaches in teaching qirā'āt, as well as filling the gap of previous research that tends to be descriptive without providing implementation solutions. The findings are expected to serve as a foothold for developing an Islamic education curriculum that is more robust, contextualised, and responsive to modern challenges. Thus, qirā'āt education can be an essential instrument in maintaining Muslims' academic and spiritual integrity, while responding to orientalist criticism with a constructive scientific approach.

Bibliography

- Ahmad, Hasani, and W O Mardiyah Nur Batubara. "Orientalisme Dan Oksidentalisme: Kajian Keotentikan Al-Qur'an." *Al-Bayan: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Hadist* 5, no. 2 (2022): 206–25.
- Al-Qāḍī, Abd al-Fattāḥ. *Al-Qira'at Asy-Syazzah Wa Taujihuha Min Lugah Al- 'Arab*. Bairut: Dar al-Kitab al-,,Arabi, 1981.
- Apriyani, Fitria, Muhammad Nur Amin, Ikhwanuddin Ikhwanuddin, and Ahmad Musyadad Kholil. "Kritik Al-Maraghi Atas Pendapat Ignaz Goldziher Dalam Buku Introduction To Islamic Theology And Law." *TAJDID: Jurnal Ilmu Ushuluddin* 22, no. 1 (2023): 52–77.
- Azmi, Ahmad Sanusi. "Kritikan Orientalis Terhadap Keaslian Bahasa Al-Quran: Analisis Terhadap Teori Perkataan Asing Dalam Al-Quran: Orientalist's Criticism on The Language of The Quran: An Analysis on The Theory of Foreign Vocabulary in The Quran." *Ma 'ālim Al-Qur'ān Wa Al-Sunnah* 15, no. 2 (2019): 93–108.
- Blachère, Régis. "Regards Sur Un Passage Parallèle Des Evangiles et Du Coran." In *Mélanges d'islamologie*, 69–73. Brill, 1974.
- Duhuri, Saifuddin. "The Representation of God in Acehnese Qur'an Translation: Wahhabi-Salafi Translations of Anthropomorphic Verses and the Verdict on Heresy." In *Qur'an Translation in Indonesia*, 60–76. Routledge, 2024.
- Ghofur, Muhammad Abdul. "Sejarah Dan Dinamika Perkembangan Wacana Kronologi Al-Qur'an Kaum Orientalis." *AN NUR: Jurnal Studi Islam* 16, no. 1 (2024): 164–78.
- Goldziher, Ignác. *Die Richtungen Der Islamischen Koranauslegung*. Vol. 6. Brill Archive, 1920.
- Goldziher, Ignác, ?-1964 'Abd al-Ḥalīm Najjār, and 'Abd al-Ḥalīm Najjār. *Madhāhib Al-Tafsīr Al-Islāmī*. Dār iqrā', 1983.
- Haidari, Sarwar. "Exploring Consciousness Through the Qur'an: A Philosophical Inquiry." *QiST: Journal of Quran and Tafseer Studies* 3, no. 2 (2024): 234–80.
- Jeffery, Arthur. "Eclecticism in Islam." *The Muslim World* 12, no. 3 (1922): 230–47.
- Karim, Abdul. "Pemikiran Orientalis Terhadap Kajian Tafsir Hadis." *Addin* 7, no. 2 (2015).
- Madzkur, Zainal Arifin. "Al-Rasm Al-'Uthmānī Fī Al-Muṣḥaf Al-Mī 'yārī Al-Indūnīsī 'inda Al-Dānī Wa Abī Dāwud." *Studia Islamika* 27, no. 1 (2020): 103–43.
- Makki, Makki. "Epistemologi Pendidikan Islam: Memutus Dominasi Barat Terhadap Pendidikan Islam." *Al-Musannif* 1, no. 2 (2019): 110–24.
- Maskhuroh, Lailatul. "Implikasi Hermeneutik Al Qur'an Dalam Epistemologi Islam." *Urwatul Wutsqo: Jurnal Studi Kependidikan Dan Keislaman* 9, no. 2 (2020): 261–74.
- Moleong, Lexy J. *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. PT. Remaja Rosdakary., 2004.
- Mudin, Moh Isom. "Sejarah Kodifikasi Mushaf Utsmani: Kritik Atas Orientalis & Liberal." *Tasfiyah: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 1, no. 2 (2017): 305–42.

- Muzayyin, Muhammad. "Al-Qur'an Menurut Pandangan Orientalis (Studi Analisis 'Teori Pengaruh' Dalam Pemikiran Orientalis)." *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Hadis* 16, no. 2 (2015): 203–21.
- Nawawi, Fuad. "Argumentasi Kemutawatiran Qira'at Sab 'Ah." *SUHUF* 17, no. 1 (2024): 23–41.
- Pahrudin, Ade. "Pengaruh Orientalis Goldziher Dalam Studi Hadis Kontemporer Di Indonesia." *Refleksi* 20, no. 1 (2021): 49–72.
- Rohanda, Rohanda, and Dian Nurrachman. "Orientalisme vs Oksidentalisme: Benturan Dan Dialogisme Budaya Global." *Jurnal Lektur Keagamaan* 15, no. 2 (2017): 377â – 389.
- Rozi, Mohamad Fathur. "Eksistensi Qiraat Al-Qur'an (Studi Kritis Atas Pemikiran Ignaz Goldziher)." *SUHUF* 9, no. 1 (2016): 123–40.
- Rukin, S Pd. *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Yayasan Ahmar Cendekia Indonesia, 2019.
- Said, Edward W. "Orientalism." In *Social Theory Re-Wired*, 362–74. Routledge, 2023.
- Salaymeh, Lena. "Deutscher Orientalismus Und Identitätspolitik: Das Beispiel Ignaz Goldziher." *Tel Aviver Jahrbuch Für Deutsche Geschichte* 45 (2017).
- Sugiyono. *Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, Dan R&D*. Edited by Alfabeta. Bandung, 2019.
- Suud, Fitriah M. "Pendidikan Kedamaian Di Era Digital (Telaah Model Forgiveness Dalam Psikologi Islam)." *Fikrotuna* 7, no. 1 (2018): 694–716.
- Suud, M. "Amsal Al-Qur'an: Sebuah Kajian Dalam Psikologi Pendidikan Islam." *Fikrotuna: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Manajemen Islam* 05, no. 01 (2017).
- Syahrullah, Ecky. "Kritik Atas Kritik Ignaz Goldziher Tentang Qirā'āt." *Al-Itqan: Jurnal Studi Al-Qur'an* 3 (2017): 118–38.
- Wahyudi, Rudi. "Kritik Terhadap Qira'ah Al-Qur'an Perspektif Orientalis." *TAFAKKUR: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir* 2, no. 1 (2021): 49–62.
- Zahro, Mufidah, and Anisa Maulidya. "Qur'anic Recitation Varieties: Recognizing Qira'at as a Spiritual Tradition." *Jurnal Studi Ilmu Alquran Dan Tafsir* 1, no. 1 (2024).