## Hadith about Religious Pluralism from Imam Syafi'i's Perspective and Its Implementation in Panjunan Bulusidokare Village, Sidoarjo

#### **Aan Darwati**

UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya Aandarwaty27@gmail.com

#### Muhid

UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya muhid@uinsby.ac.id

### Isnaini Lulu' Atim Muthohar

UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya

Corresponding Author: Aan Darwati

Article history: Received: Juli 17, 2024 | Revised: Oktober 23, 2024 | Available

Online: Desember 05, 2024

#### **Abstract**

This research examines inter-religious harmony in Panjunan Bulusidokare Village, Sidoarjo, with a focus on tolerance and religious pluralism, as well as the application of Imam Syafi'i's perspective in social and religious contexts. The purpose of this study is to understand the dynamics of tolerance between religious communities, especially in terms of mutual understanding and respect for religious differences, and to identify the principles of pluralism according to Imam Syafi'i that are relevant in the daily lives of people in Panjunan Bulusidokare Village. This research used a qualitative approach with a case study design. Data were collected through in-depth interviews with religious leaders, community leaders, and community members from various religions in the village. Data analysis used a thematic approach to identify patterns and themes related to religious pluralism and tolerance by applying John Hick's theory of pluralism that distinguishes two types of religious experience: the experience of God as a personal and non-personal entity. This study found that religious tolerance in Panjunan Bulusidokare Village is achieved through mutual understanding, respect for differences, and prioritizing the principle of social cooperation between religious communities. In addition, the results show that tolerance in Islam is not only based on religious beliefs but also in the context of protecting non-Muslim rights and inclusive social interactions. The contribution of this research is to enrich the understanding of tolerance and religious pluralism, particularly in the context of rural communities in Indonesia, as well as integrating Imam Syafi'i's perspective within the framework of John Hick's theory of pluralism to promote interfaith harmony. It also provides practical guidance for creating a more harmonious and respectful society amidst religious differences.

**Keywords:** Religious harmony; tolerance; religious pluralism; Imam Syafi'i.

#### **Introduction**

Issues related to religious conflict, intolerance, and radicalization are increasingly dominating attention in various parts of the world, including Indonesia. As a country known for its religious diversity, Indonesia faces great challenges in maintaining religious pluralism. Despite being recognized as having six official religions: Islam, Christianity, Catholicism, Buddhism, Hinduism, and Confucianism, religious pluralism is often tested by the emergence of inter-religious and inter-faith conflicts within one religion that worsen social relations. One form of rejection of this diversity is the violation of religious freedom, discrimination against religious minorities, destruction of places of worship, and restrictions on religious activities.<sup>2</sup>

In the history of Indonesia, religious conflicts such as the one in Poso in 1992, the dispute between Sunni and Shia in East Java around 2006,<sup>3</sup> The conflict over the construction of GKI Yasmin in Bogor, which continued until 2008, illustrates the tensions arising from religious differences.<sup>4</sup> This shows that religious diversity is not always seen as a "blessing" but often as a threat to national unity. This reality reflects the great challenge of maintaining religious pluralism in Indonesia, which, despite its rich diversity, remains vulnerable to social conflicts due to differences in belief.<sup>5</sup>

This research aims to explore how village communities manage religious diversity in a local context, with a focus on the village of Panjunan Bulusidokare, Sidoarjo. In the midst of the increasingly complex challenges of religious pluralism, this research highlights the importance of Imam Syafi'i's perspective in building inter-religious harmony. Besides that, the Syafi'i Mazhab is one of the madhhabs in Islam that has a major influence on the development of law and the life of Muslims in Indonesia, given the many challenges faced

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> SETARA Institute for Democracy and Peace, "The Condition of Freedom of Religion or Belief 2023; From Stagnation to New Stagnation (Jakarta, 2024)," *SETARA Institute for Democracy and Peace*, 2024, 1-16, https://setara-institute.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/06/Rilis-Data-Kondisi-KBB-2023\_Setara-Institute\_Ind.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Gusnanda Gusnanda and Nuraini Nuraini, "Considering the Urgency of Ukhuwah Wathaniyah in Cases of Religious Intolerance in Indonesia," *Fuaduna Journal: Journal of Religious and Social Studies* 4, no. 1 (June 30, 2020): 1, https://doi.org/10.30983/fuaduna.v4i1.3237.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Hodari, "Shia-Sunni Political Movement in Karang Gayam Village and Blu "Uran Village Sampang Madura" 05 (2015): 232-53.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Ilovia Aya et al., "The Poso Conflict: History and Efforts to Resolve It," *JUPIIS: JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE EDUCATION* 13 (June 15, 2021): 1, https://doi.org/10.24114/jupiis.v13i1.18618.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Moh Dannur et al., "Madurese Islam: Dissemination of Multicultural Education in Islamic Religious Streams," *TADRIS: Journal of Islamic Education* 18, no. 2 (2023).

by people who live in areas with high religious diversity. This research is expected to provide a deeper understanding of how Imam Syafi'i's principles can be the basis for creating interreligious harmony at the local level.

There have been many studies on religious pluralism in Indonesia, but most of them focus on the context of the concept and paradigm of pluralism. This study is particularly relevant because it focuses on Imam Syafi'i's perspective and is linked to a specific case in Panjnan Burshidkar Village, which has not been widely explored in the literature on religious pluralism. In the midst of rapid economic and social development, the people of this village face great challenges in maintaining inter-religious harmony. Therefore, it is important to understand how they manage religious differences in their daily lives.

Some previous literature examines religious pluralism, including the works of Mohammad FattHun Ni'am and Mustikawati in "Islam and Pluralism: Reinterpretation of the Concept of al-HanafiyH and As-SamhH in Prophetic Hadith," Zulfarizal and Vira FharadillH in "Pluralism in Hadith Perspective" And Wildan Amiruddin and Liliek Channa in "Religious Pluralism in Balun Lamongan Village Viewed from a Hadith Perspective." However, research on religious pluralism from the perspective of Imam Syafi'i in the village of Panjunan Bulusidokare. A more in-depth study of Imam Syafi'i's role in promoting interreligious dialogue and tolerance is still rarely found in the existing literature. This indicates a gap in the existing literature, which is the main reason why the researcher chose this topic.

The research focuses on the rarely explored village of Panjunan Bulusidokare and the application of Imam Syafi'i's perspective in understanding religious pluralism. This perspective has not been widely used in the study of religious pluralism in Indonesia, even though Imam Syafi'i's teachings are very relevant in building harmony and inter-religious dialogue. By looking at religious pluralism from Imam Syafi'i's perspective, this research

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Mohammad Fattahun Ni'am and Mustikawati Mustikawati, "Islam and Pluralism: Reinterpretation of the Concept of Al-Ḥanīfiyyah and as-Samḥah in Prophetic Hadiths," in *International Conference on Cultures & Languages (ICCL)*, vol. 1, 2022, 390-407.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Zulfarizal Zulfarizal and Vira Fharadillah, "PLURALISM IN HADITH PERSPECTIVE," *AL ISNAD: Journal of Indonesian Hadith Studies* 3, no. 2 (2022): 127-34.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Wildan Amiruddin, "Religious Pluralism in Balun Lamongan Village Viewed from a Hadith Perspective" (Surabaya, n.d.).

offers a more contextual approach that can be applied to strengthen inter-religious harmony in Indonesian society.

This research is expected to provide practical insights into the concrete steps that communities, governments, and religious institutions can take to strengthen interreligious harmony at the local level. Through a deeper understanding of the principles of tolerance and interreligious dialog taught by Imam Syafi'i, communities can more wisely manage diversity and reduce tensions that may arise due to religious differences. This research can pave the way for the creation of more inclusive policies that support harmonious religious pluralism in Indonesia.

#### Method

This research used a qualitative approach with a focus on case studies. Data collection was conducted through in-depth interviews with religious leaders, community leaders, and community members from various religions in Panjunan Bulusidokare Village. The collected data were then thematically analyzed to identify patterns and emerging themes related to the dynamics of religious pluralism and Imam Syafi'i's perspective. These interviews can help in understanding the dynamics of inter-religious relations and the strategies used to promote tolerance.

The data was analyzed using John Hick's theory of pluralism, a philosopher of religion. In his paper on Religious Pluralism, John Hick states that religious experiences can be categorized into two types. He introduces the idea of "comparative theology" and highlights that individuals' religious experiences can influence how they understand other religions. The first is the experience of God's existence as a real personal entity. The second is the experience of the existence of the Absolute and God as non-personal entities.<sup>9</sup>

### Biography and Intellectuality of Imam Syafi'i

Imam Syafi'i's full name is Muhammad ibn Idris ibn al Abbas ibn Usman ibn Syafi'i ibn al-Sa'ib ibn Ubaid ibn Abd Yazid ibn Hashim ibn Abd al-Muthalib ibn Abd Manaf. Imam

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Theguh Saumantri, "Building Religious Harmony in the Era of PLURALISM: The Contribution of John Hick's Concept," n.d.

SHfi'I's four grandfathers were companions, and his lineage met the Prophet through his grandfather Abd Manaf, who was the uncle of the Prophet's grandfather Abd al-Muthalib.<sup>10</sup> The place of birth of Imam Syafi'i, some say in Yemen, then his mother took him to migrate to Mecca. The second opinion is Imam Syafi'i was born in Gaza, then his mother took him to the Asqalan area close to Gaza, Palestine.<sup>11</sup> Imam Syafi'i was born in 150 H and was two years old when his mother took him to Mecca.<sup>12</sup> Imam Syafi'i died on Friday night at the end of the month of Rajab after the isha prayer. He was buried on Friday when the moon of Sha'ban was sighted in 204 H.<sup>13</sup>

Living in Mecca, where his ancestors came from, and with a good environment, many scholars and students studied Islam from various branches of science. This helped Imam Syafi'i become a person who also loves knowledge and learning. Imam Syafi'i is also a smart child and fast at memorizing. During this period, he spent twelve years studying (152-164 H). After gaining expertise in linguistics, history, the Qur'an, and Al-Hadith, he continued his studies with several teachers in the city of MakkH, where his reputation became widely known. His intelligence and expertise in knowledge attracted the attention of a prominent teacher, Abu Muslim bin Khalid Al-Zinji, who permitted him to give fatwas at the age of fifteen. Later, with the permission of this teacher, he moved to Medina. <sup>15</sup>

Imam Syafi'i then went to Medina (164H-179 H) and studied with Imam Malik. For fifteen years, he accompanied Imam Malik and learned knowledge from him until Imam Malik died in 179 H. His relationship with other scholars in Medina, both those who stayed and those who came from outside, was good and fruitful. He inherited knowledge not only from Imam Malik but also from other prominent scholars of the city. After that, he went to Baghdad in 195 H and stayed there for two years. Many scholars came to learn from him, and most of them switched from their previous madhhab to his. Imam Shafo'i also compiled a book of old opinions during his stay in Baghdad. Later, he returned to Mecca in 197 H, but

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> 'Abdu al-Halim al-Jundi, *Al-Imam Al-Shafi'i Nashir al-sunnah Wawadi'u al-Usul* (Cairo: Dar al- Ma'arif, 1119), 27.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Abu Bakr al-Baihaqi, Ma'rifah al-Sunan Wa al-Atas (Cairo: Dar al-Wa'yu, 1991), 202.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Abu Nu'aim al-Asbahani, Hilyah al-Auliya Wa Tabaqat al-Asfiya (Cairo: Dar al-Fikr, 1996), 67.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Abi Hatim al-Razi, Adab al-Shafi'i Wa Managibuhu (Cairo: Maktabah al-Khanzi, 1413), 55.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> al-Jundi, Al-Imam Al-Shafi'i Nashir al-sunnah Wawadi'u al-Usul, 52.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> M Jafar, "IMAM ASY-SYAFI'I AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF HIS MAZHAB" 7 (2018).

a year later, in 198 H, he returned to Baghdad. After some time there, he went to Egypt, where he settled down and developed his thoughts in jurisprudence, which resulted in a new opinion known as the new opinion.<sup>16</sup>

There is hardly any branch of knowledge that Imam Syafi'i did not master. Hmad ibn Hanbal once praised Imam SHfi' othat when we look at the science of Hadith, we will find that there is no one more expert than Imam Syafi'i in the field of Hadith. When we look at the branch of Jurisprudence, we will find that there is no one more expert than SHfi'i in the field of Jurisprudence. When we look at the science of the Qur'an, we will find that Imam SHfi'i is the most expert in the field of the Qur'an. In conclusion, Hmad ibn Hanbal praised that no one is more expert in all branches of Islamic science than Imam Syafi'i. <sup>17</sup>

Imam Syafi'i died in 820 AD in the city of Fustat, Egypt, at a relatively young age. However, his legacy in the form of his writings and thoughts lives on and inspires generations after him. Imam Syafi'i's madhhab, which is based on the teachings and methodology he developed, became one of the four major madhhabs in Sunni Islam and has widespread influence throughout the Islamic world. His works also remain an important source of study in Islamic scholarship to this day. Imam Syafi'i is a highly respected figure in Islamic history, not only for his contribution to the development of the science of fiqh but also for his integrity as a scholar and thought leader. His rich legacy in the form of writings and scholarly thought continues to inspire and influence Muslims around the world.

## Overview of Panjunan Village, Sidoarjo Regency, and its Pluralism Values

#### 1. Profile of Panjungan Village

The village identified by the author is located in Bulusidokare administrative village in Sidoarjo district, East Java province, Indonesia. It can be reached by traveling 2 kilometers southeast from the Sidoarjo district square. The village is bordered by Sekardangan and Celep villages to the south, Pekauman village to the west, and RangkH Kidul village to the east. Several community associations and neighborhood associations are operating within Bulusidokare.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Fahrur Rozi, "THE MIND OF THE FIQH MAZHAB OF IMAM SYAFI'I," *HAKAM: Journal of Islamic Law Studies and Islamic Economic Law* 5, no. 2 (March 28, 2022), https://doi.org/10.33650/jhi.v5i2.3502.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> al-Jundi, Al-Imam Al-Shafi'i Nashir al-sunnah Wawadi'u al-Usul, 6.

### 2. Religious Pluralism

Before further discussing pluralism, it would be nice to see the term in the Big Indonesian Dictionary that the basic word of pluralism is plural, which means plural or more than one. Meanwhile, pluralism itself is the state of plural societies concerned with social and political systems. However, let's look at the outline of pluralism itself. There are three outlines of the meaning and true meaning of pluralism itself; namely, Pluralism is *active engagement* in the midst of diversity and difference. Second, pluralism is in the context of tolerance because from tolerance will come an awareness of the importance of respecting others. Third, non-relativism pluralism means that there is no limited relationship between neighbors, but the expected pluralism is to find a commitment between particularities. Or, simply put, pluralism is binding, not releasing differences. So we must respect each other and live together peacefully.

So, life together in the context of social pluralism requires a conscious bond, always encouraging cooperation, and so on. Because God designed this pluralism always to be multiculturalism, and the most important thing is not to stop at pluralism which only appreciates diversity and differences in life but must also be more "homo multiculturalist," namely increasing pluralist relations which include minority and majority problems, in this case, it must be built with concrete actions based on recognition of equality, equality and justice.<sup>19</sup>

Several important points explain pluralism. First, acceptance of diversity at this point. Pluralism recognizes that society consists of various groups that have differences in terms of religion, culture, language, race, and others. This means accepting that no one group or view is dominant or superior but rather that each group has valuable values and contributions. Second, respect and tolerance. Pluralism encourages mutual respect and tolerance between groups. This means respecting the right of each individual or group to practice their religion and beliefs without discrimination or pressure from other groups.

Third, Dialogue and cooperation, then at this point explains Pluralism promotes open and constructive dialogue between different groups to understand each other's perspectives

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Mizanul Akrom, METAMORFOSA ISLAMIC EDUCATION BASED ON PLURALISM (GUEPEDIA, t.t.), 38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Moh Shofan, *Pluralism Saves the Religions* (Samudra Biru, 2011), 69.

and seek common ground and solutions to existing differences. This creates a foundation for cooperation between groups in creating an inclusive and harmonious society. Fourth is the protection of human rights; Pluralism believes that every individual has human rights that must be respected and protected, including the right to freedom of religion and belief, the right to expression, and the right to non-discrimination. Fifth, the importance of laws and institutions; this last point discusses Pluralism and recognizes the importance of fair and neutral laws and institutions in maintaining peace and justice amidst the diversity of society. This includes legal protection of minority rights and impartial law enforcement.

So far it can be understood that pluralism is an awareness of recognizing the existence of others. If it is associated with religion, the meaning of pluralism also automatically recognizes the existence of other religions, which is marked by tolerant communication between religious people. If quoting the opinion of Budi Munawar RHman, who Nurul Huda also quotes in his book, explains that to be religious today is to be interreligious; a person's religiosity in the modern era is to recognize the existence of a religion that is believed and realize and understand the existence of other religions.<sup>20</sup> Awareness of the existence of this difference is a reality that must be accepted. People who think pluralism must possess the ability to interact positively in an environment of plurality.

According to Nicholas Madjid, religious pluralism can be taken through three religious attitudes, namely first, an exclusive attitude in seeing other religions; this attitude views other religions as the wrong way, which misleads the people. *Second*, an inclusive attitude, this attitude views other religions as an implicit form of our religion. Third, the attitude of pluralism this attitude can be expressed in various formulations, for example, "other religions are the wrong way, which misleads the people." proof that Islam is inclusive is found in SurH Ali Imran; 85 "Whoever seeks a religion other than Islam, at no time (his religion) will not be accepted from him and in the hereafter he will be among those who lose."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Firdaus M. Yunus, "AGAMA AND PLURALISM," *Islamic Scientific Journal Futura* 13, no. 2 (February 1, 2014): 213, https://doi.org/10.22373/jiif.v13i2.72.

## Hadith on Religious Pluralism from Imam Syafi'i's Perspective

حَدَّثَنَا يَخْيَى بْنُ بُكَيْرٍ : حَدَّثَنَا اللَّيْثُ، عَنْ عُقَيْلٍ، عَنِ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ :أَخْبَرِنِي عُبَيْدُ اللّهِ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللّهِ بْنِ عُبْبَةَ :أَنَّ أَبَا هُرَيْرَةَ قَالَ لَمَّا تُوفِيِّ النَّبِيُّ صلى الله عليه وسلم وَاسْتُخْلِفَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ، وَكَفَرَ مَنْ كَفَرَ مِنَ الْعَرَ، قَالَ عُمَرَ : يَا هُرَيْرَةَ قَالَ لَسَّاسُ، وَقَدْ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللّهِ صلى الله عليه وسلم) :أُمِرْتُ أَنْ أُقَاتِلُ النَّاسَ حَتَّى يَقُولُوا : لَا الله إِلَّا الله إِلَه إِلَّا الله عَلَى الله وسلم وَاسَّهُ إِلَّا بِكَتِّهِ وَحِسَابُه عَلَى الله (قَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ : إِلَهَ إِلَّا الله عَلَى الله وسلم لَقَاتَلُتُهُمْ عَلَى الله عليه وسلم لَقَاتَلُتُهُمْ عَلَى . مَنْعِهَا وَاللّهِ لَوْ مَنَعُونِي عَنَاقًا كَانُوا يُؤَدُّونَا إِلَى رَسُولِ اللّهِ صلى الله عليه وسلم لَقَاتَلْتُهُمْ عَلَى .

Told YHya ibn Abu Bakr, Told Lais from Uqail from Ibn Shihab, told UbaidillH ibn AbdillH ibn UtbH that Aba HurairH said: Did not RaasulullH say "I am commanded to fight people until they say *Lailha illallah*." If they have said it, then they have protected their blood and property from me, except according to their rights, while their account is with Allah." Abu Bakr replied, "Among his rights is that if they had not given me a rope that they used to give to the Messenger of Allah (SAW) then I would have fought them for it." (HR. al-Bukhari).

The Hadith is listed in the *Kutubu Sittah* with similar wording to the text, so it is valid.<sup>21</sup> It was narrated in the context of Caliph Abu Bakr al-Sidiq declaring his intention to fight individuals who refused to pay zakat and reverted to apostasy. The reaction to this intention came from the Companion Umar ibn al-Khattab, who rejected it by referring to the Prophet's saying that fighting is only justified until the individual declares Laa ilaHa illallaH. At this point, the killing of the individual becomes forbidden, as does the taking of his property. <sup>22</sup>

Imam Syafi'i argued that if a person has explicitly acknowledged the existence of Allah as the One Divine entity and that the Prophet Muhammad was sent as His messenger, then shedding his blood and seizing his property becomes forbidden. Such an individual should be afforded the same protection and respect as that afforded to fellow Muslims, as human judgment can only encompass what is physically visible. Meanwhile, what is hidden in a person's heart or inner actions is a matter that falls under the judgment of Allah alone. <sup>23</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Muhammad ibn Idris as-Shafi'i, *ar-Risalah* (Egypt: Mushtafa al-Babi al-Halbi, 1938), 326.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Abu 'Abdullah al-Bukhari, *Sahih al-Bukhari* (Damascus: Dar Ibn Kathir, 1993), 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Abu 'Abdullah Al-Shafi'i, *Al-Um* (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, 1990), 170.

# Imam Syafi'i's Perspective on Religious Pluralism and Its Implementation in Panjunan Village, Bulusidokare Sub-District, Sidoarjo Regency.

Although the term "religious pluralism" was not yet known at the time of Imam Syafi'i, the principles taught by him remain relevant in the context of religious pluralism as we understand it today. It should be noted that "religious pluralism" in the modern context refers more to equality between religions within the framework of human rights and religious freedom, where all religions are considered equal and respected within the social and political structure. Meanwhile, Imam Syafi'i's teachings emphasize more on the relationship between Muslims and non-Muslims (*ahlu al-DhimmH*) in the context of Islamic governance. In this regard, the term religious pluralism should be used with caution to distinguish between the modern concept of religious equality and classical Islamic teachings that emphasized the protection of non-Muslim rights under the Islamic state without blurring the line between history and the modern context.<sup>24</sup>

In his work Al-Umm, Imam Syafi'i strongly emphasizes the protection of the rights of non-Muslims living under Islamic rule by making them part of *ahlu al-DhimmH*.<sup>25</sup> In this context, he views that non-Muslims are entitled to protection in terms of life, property, and religious freedom, provided they do not threaten social stability or state security. Tolerance in Imam Syafi'i's teachings is directed more towards the political and legal relationship between Muslims and non-Muslims, concentrating on the state's obligation to safeguard the rights of citizens, regardless of their religion.

However, as William Ruston's theory of religious pluralism reveals, the term "pluralism" in the modern context focuses on equality between religions.<sup>26</sup> This is in contrast to Imam Syafi'i's understanding, where he recognized religious diversity but emphasized the protection of the rights of non-Muslims within the larger social structure of Islam rather than the equal recognition of other religions as legitimate within the theological view of Islam.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Moh Dahlan, "The Paradigm of Multicultural Usul Fikih in Indonesia," *Ijtihad: Journal of Islamic Law and Humanity Discourse* 12, no. 1 (2012): 1-19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Imam As-Shafi'i, *AL-UMM: The Master Book of Islamic Figh* (Republika Publishers, 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Thomas William Ruston, "The John Hick Papers: Religious Pluralism in the Archives," *The Expository Times* 128, no. 1 (2016): 4-19.

## The Difference Between Tolerance in Classical Islam and the Modern Concept of Religious Pluralism

In Imam Syafi'i's teachings, tolerance does not involve recognizing other religions as valid in terms of belief (aqidah) but rather recognizing their social and political rights as citizens. For example, in the context of Ahlu al-DhimmH, Imam Syafi'i views that non-Muslims have the right to practice their religion and should not be forced to embrace Islam. However, this is in the context of an Islamic state that controls the political and social aspects, not in the context of social-religious pluralism that respects the diversity of religious views and beliefs in society as a whole.

This difference is also explained in a study by Irfan looking at the relationship between Islamic law and religious pluralism in the modern context, who emphasizes that while there is recognition of religious diversity, classical Islam does not allow for the recognition of other religions as valid in terms of *aqidah*.<sup>27</sup> Therefore, while there was room for tolerance in the social and political realms, acceptance of other religions in terms of theological truth remained limited.

Although the tolerance referred to in Imam Syafi'i's teachings focuses more on protecting the rights of non-Muslims under Islamic rule, these principles can still be applied in the broader context of religious pluralism. In Panjunan Village, Bulusidokare Village, Sidoarjo District, we can see the implementation of the values of tolerance and social cooperation taught by Imam Syafi'i. In this village, different religions coexist in harmony, and although there are diverse views, most residents are able to respect the rights of each individual to practice their beliefs.

Along with efforts to maintain social harmony, the people of Panjunan Village demonstrate how the principles of tolerance in Islam, as taught by Imam Syafi'i, can be applied in daily life. For example, despite religious differences, places of worship from different religions stand side by side, reflecting mutual respect and protection of religious rights. This shows that in social life, not only at the state level but also in interactions between individuals, tolerance, and protection of the rights of non-Muslims are still relevant.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Irfan Irfan, "Pluralism and Interfaith Dialogue," *Al-Mubarak Journal: Journal of Qur'anic Studies and Tafsir* 3, no. 2 (2018): 56-74.

However, there are also challenges, as shown in the research on the village. Although the majority of residents show tolerance, some individuals or groups with more conservative views still show resistance to religious diversity. This phenomenon reflects the importance of a deeper understanding of the principles of tolerance and social cooperation taught by Imam Syafi'i in the broader context of religious pluralism, which includes not only legal and political aspects but also personal and social aspects.

The tolerance taught by Imam Syafi'i has strong relevance in the context of religious pluralism as we understand it today. However, there is a difference in emphasis between the protection of non-Muslim rights in the context of Islamic governance and the modern concept of religious pluralism, which is more about equality between religions. The principles taught by Imam Syafi'i, such as justice, protection of rights, and social cooperation, can be applied in modern society to create harmony between different religions. However, it is important to distinguish between tolerance, which focuses more on political and social aspects, and modern religious pluralism, which emphasizes religious equality in the theological realm. The implementation of these values, both in the context of the Panjunan Village community and in daily life, shows that Imam Syafi'i's teachings remain relevant in building an inclusive society that respects religious diversity.

## **Limits of Tolerance in Islam**

Tolerance in Islam is often misunderstood as a form of religious syncretism, which considers all religions equal or can be mixed. In fact, in Islamic teachings, tolerance does not mean ignoring differences or equalizing all religions. The term *tasâmuh*, which is often interpreted as tolerance, actually refers more to mutual respect, not to the merging of right and wrong religious teachings (*talbisu al-haqq wa al-batil*). The syncretic attitude that considers that all religions have the same truth is contrary to the basic principles of Islam, which emphasize that only Islam is the true revelation.

The attitude of tolerance taught in Islam is clearly seen in the teachings on relations with non-Muslims. For example, in SurH *Al-Imran* (3:64), Allah SWT instructs Prophet Muhammad to invite the people of the book (Jews and Christians) to believe in the same God, Allah, without associating Him with anything. This verse shows that Islam invites

dialogue with non-Muslims but still maintains the basic principles of the Islamic creed and does not force them to recognize the truth of Islam. This reflects an attitude of tolerance in the form of respect for different beliefs while still upholding the teachings of Islam.

In this context, we can see that tolerance in Islam does not mean equalizing different religious beliefs but rather respecting the right of each individual to practice their respective beliefs, as long as they do not conflict with the main principles of Islam. As mentioned in *QS. Al-Kafirun* (109:1-6), a verse that was revealed in the context of the Prophet Muhammad being faced with a compromise invitation from the Meccan polytheists to alternate worship, with an agreement that the Prophet could not accept. This verse states explicitly that "for you is your religion, and for me is my religion," which means that Islam recognizes religious differences but does not make it a basis for compromise in matters of *aqidah*.

## Theoretical Explanation and Relevance to Current Research

From a theological perspective, tolerance in Islam emphasizes the importance of maintaining justice and respect for individual rights without sacrificing religious principles.<sup>28</sup> Debabrata Datta's research states that the attitude of tolerance in Islam is deeply rooted in the understanding that religious diversity is part of God's destiny.<sup>29</sup> This is in line with the theory of *religious pluralism* developed by John Hick, which asserts that religious differences should be seen as a form of spiritual wealth that needs to be respected, not as a threat to a particular religious identity.<sup>30</sup>

However, within the framework of Islam, although there is room for mutual respect and dialog, the limits of tolerance remain, especially in matters of faith (*aqidah*). Islam does not allow the unification of right and wrong religious teachings. This is reinforced by research conducted by Mohammad Shatnawi, which shows that in social practice, Muslims in Indonesia tend to be more tolerant of non-Muslims in social and cultural aspects but still

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> John Hick, A Christian Theology of Religions: The Rainbow of Faiths (Westminster John Knox Press, 1995).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Debabrata Datta, Sangeeta Mishra, and S Suman Rajest, "Quantification of Tolerance Limits of Engineering Systems Using Uncertainty Modeling for Sustainable Energy," *International Journal of Intelligent Networks* 1 (2020): 1-8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Theguh Saumantri, "Building Religious Harmony in the Era of Pluralism: The Contribution of John Hick's Concept," *Religi: Journal of Religious Studies* 19, no. 1 (2023): 111-27.

maintain the clarity of *aqidah* boundaries that cannot be compromised.<sup>31</sup> The study found that despite the recognition of religious diversity, acceptance of other religions in the realm of *aqidah* remains limited.

## Implementation of Tolerance in Social Life

Empirically, in some areas in Indonesia, such as in Panjunan Village, Sidoarjo, tolerance between religions can be seen in the form of recognition of religious diversity, where people can live side by side despite having different beliefs. This shows that Islamic teachings that emphasize justice and respect for the rights of non-Muslims can be implemented in everyday social life. However, as explained in the research by Lusi Nur HalimH, although there is tolerance in the social aspect, recognition of other religions in the realm of *aqidah* remains a challenge in Muslim society. This shows that tolerance in Islam is indeed limited to social and worldly interests but does not include recognition of the truth of other religions in terms of *aqidah*.<sup>32</sup>

Tolerance in Islam is a very clear attitude, which is to appreciate and respect religious differences without confusing the right and the false. While there is room for dialogue and interaction with non-Muslims, tolerance in Islam does not mean equating different religions in terms of *aqidah*. Recent research and theory support the view that tolerance in Islam, while emphasizing social and humanitarian aspects, still maintains boundaries that should not be exceeded in terms of faith. Therefore, it is important to understand that tolerance in Islam is respect for diversity while remaining firm on the principles of the truth of Islamic teachings.

#### Conclusion

The expected harmony of religious life is harmony between religious believers in the spirit of mutual understanding, understanding each other. In other words, in language, understanding means knowing about something. It can be interpreted as understanding the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Mohammad Turki Mohammad Shatnawi, "The Islamic-Christian Conflict In Northern Andalusia During The Reign Of Caliph Abd Al-Rahman Al-Nasser III," *Journal of Namibian Studies: History Politics Culture* 37 (2023): 1139-63.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Lusi Nur Halimah, "Implementation of Tolerance as an Islamic Education Value in the Socio-Religious Life of Plural Communities," *Al-Fikri: Journal of Islamic Education Studies and Research* 5, no. 2 (2022): 131-41.

Aan Darwati dkk, Hadith about Religious Pluralism from Imam Syafi'i's Perspective and Its Implementation in Panjunan Bulusidokare Village, Sidoarjo

situation of others and knowing and understanding social problems so that they can feel what others feel, especially in the village of Panjunan Bulusidokare, Sidoarjo.

Based on what has been explained in the discussion, several conclusions can be made, among others: First, Tolerance is an attitude of giving ease, being open-minded, and respecting others who are different from us. Second, there are two points about pluralism according to Imam Syafi'i, namely, Tolerance and Social Cooperation, Protection of Non-Muslim Rights, and Economic and Social Interaction. Third, the attitude of tolerance in religion is to respect other religious beliefs by not equating other religious beliefs with Islamic beliefs themselves. Although there are limits to tolerance in Islam, it does not make Muslims differentiate between fellow human beings because, basically, we are the same creatures in the eyes of Allah SWT. Still, it is necessary to pay attention to the points to limit intolerance so that they can be used in everyday life.

### **Bibliography**

Abdu al-Halim al-Jundi, *Al-Imam Al-Syafi'i Nashir al-sunnH Wawadi'u al-Usul* (Cairo: Dar al- Ma'arif, 1119)

Abi Hatim al-Razi, Adab al-Syafi'i Wa Managibuhu (Cairo: MaktabH al-Khanzi, 1413).

Abu 'AbdullH al-Bukhari, SHih al-Bukhari (Damascus: Dar Ibn Kathir, 1993).

Abu 'AbdullH Al-Syafi'i, *Al-Um* (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, 1990).

Abu Bakr al-Baihaqi, Ma'rifH al-Sunan Wa al-Atas (Cairo: Dar al-Wa'yu, 1991).

Abu Nu'aim al-AsbHani, HilyH al-Auliya Wa Tabaqat al-Asfiya (Cairo: Dar al-Fikr, 1996).

al-Jundi, Al-Imam Al-Syafi'i Nashir al-sunnH Wawadi'u al-Usul.

al-Jundi, Al-Imam Al-Syafi'i Nashir al-sunnH Wawadi'u al-Usul.

Akrom, Mizanul. Metamorphosis Of Pluralism-Based Islamic Education. Guepedia, t.t.

Al-Syafi'i, Abu 'AbdullH. Al-Um. Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, 1990.

AsbHani, Abu Nu'aim al-. HilyH al-Auliya Wa Tabaqat al-Asfiya. Cairo: Dar al-Fikr, 1996.

AzizH ZakiyyH, Annisa. "Hadiths About Religious Tolerance in the Understanding and Practice of Smk Texar Karawang Students." *Journal of Ushuluddin Science Research* Vol. 2 No. 3 (August 2022): 615-29.

Baihagi, Abu Bakr al-. Ma'rifH al-Sunan Wa al-Atas. Cairo: Dar al-Wa'yu, 1991.

Bukhari, Abu 'AbdullH al-. SHih al-Bukhari. Damasakus: Dar Ibn Kathir, 1993.

Firman, FirmansyH, Achmad Abubakar, and Muhammad Yusuf. "Building a Diverse Life: T*Ahlu*ili Study of Qs. AL Hujurat Verse 13." *Al-Mubarak Journal: Journal of Al-Qur'an and Tafsir Studies* 8, no. 2 (December 31, 2023): 47–60. https://doi.org/10.47435/al-mubarak.v8i2.2418.

Gusnanda, Gusnanda, and Nuraini Nuraini. "Considering the Urgency of UkhuwH WathaniyH in the Case of Religious Intolerance in Indonesia." *Fuaduna Journal: Journal of Religious and Social Studies* 4, no. 1 (June 30, 2020): 1. https://doi.org/10.30983/fuaduna.v4i1.3237.

Muhammad ibn Idris as-Shafi'. ar-RisalH. Egypt: Mushtafa al-Babi al-Halbi, 1938.

Jafar, M. "Imam Asy-Syafi'i and The Development of His Mazhab" 7 (2018).

Jundi, 'Abdu al-Halim al-. *Al-Imam Al-Syafi 'i Nashir al-sunnH Wawadi'u al-Usul*. Cairo: Dar al-Ma'arif, 1119.

Khaerun Rijaal, M. Ardini. "The Phenomenon of Interfaith Intolerance and the Role of Social Media Instagram Accounts of the Gusdurian Indonesia Network in Conveying Messages of Tolerance." *Syiar | Journal of Islamic Communication and Broadcasting* 1, no. 2 (December 5, 2021): 103–32. https://doi.org/10.54150/syiar.v1i2.41.

Maksum, Ali. "Models Of Tolerance Education in Modern and Salaf Pesantren" 03 (2015).

Ali Maksum. Pluralism and multiculturalism: a *new paradigm of Islamic religious education in Indonesia*. Aditya Media Publishing, 2011.

- Prihatiningrum, Divya, and Wiwit Hariyanto. "Analysis of Accounting Information Systems in Islamic Perspective:" *Indonesian Journal of Islamic Studies* 3 (February 28, 2021): 10.21070/ijis.v3i0.1579-10.21070/ijis.v3i0.1579.
- Razi, Abi Hatim al-. Adab al-Syafi'i Wa Manaqibuhu. Cairo: MaktabH al-Khanzi, 1413.
- Rozi, FHrur. "The Fiqh School of Thought of Imam Syafi'i." *HAKAM: Journal of Islamic Law Studies and Islamic Economic Law* 5, no. 2 (March 28, 2022). https://doi.org/10.33650/jhi.v5i2.3502.
- Saumantri, Theguh. "Building Religious Harmony in The Era of Pluralism: The Contribution of John Hick's Concept," n.d.
- Shihab, M. Quraish. "Grounding" the Quran: The Function and Role of Revelation in Public Life. Mizan Library, 2007.
- Shofan, Moh. Pluralism Saves the Religions. Samudra Biru, 2011.
- Tualeka, M WHid Nur. "Critical Study on Religious Tolerance in Islam" 2, no. 2 (2016).
- Yunus, Firdaus M. "Agama and Pluralism." *Futura Islamic Scientific Journal* 13, no. 2 (February 1, 2014): 213. https://doi.org/10.22373/jiif.v13i2.72.
- As-Syafi'i, Imam. AL-UMM: The Master Book of Islamic Fiqh. Republika Publishers, 2018.
- DHlan, Moh. "The Paradigm of Multicultural Jurisprudence in Indonesia." *Ijtihad: Journal of Islamic Law and Humanity Discourse* 12, no. 1 (2012): 1-19.
- Datta, Debabrata, Sangeeta Mishra, and S Suman Rajesh. "Quantification of Tolerance Limits of Engineering Systems Using Uncertainty Modeling for Sustainable Energy." *International Journal of Intelligent Networks* 1 (2020): 1-8.
- HalimH, Lusi Nur. "Implementation of Tolerance Attitude as an Islamic Education Value in the Socio-Religious Life of Plural Communities." *Al-Fikri: Journal of Islamic Education Studies and Research* 5, no. 2 (2022): 131-41.
- Hick, John. *A Christian Theology of Religions: The Rainbow of Faiths*. Westminster John Knox Press, 1995.
- Irfan, Irfan. "Pluralism and Interfaith Dialogue." *Al-Mubarak Journal: Journal of Qur'anic and Tafsir Studies* 3, no. 2 (2018): 56-74.
- Ruston, Thomas William. "The John Hick Papers: Religious Pluralism in the Archives." *The Expository Times* 128, no. 1 (2016): 4-19.
- Saumantri, Theguh. "Building Religious Harmony in the Era of Pluralism: The Contribution of John Hick's Concept." *Religi: Journal of Religious Studies* 19, no. 1 (2023): 111-27.
- Shatnawi, Mohammad Turki Mohammad. "The Islamic-Christian Conflict In Northern Andalusia During The Reign Of Caliph Abd Al-RHman Al-Nasser III." *Journal of Namibian Studies: History Politics Culture* 37 (2023): 1139-63.