

# Experience-Based Religious Values Education in the Umrah Pilgrimage: Mixed-Methods Evidence of Uneven Change Across Religiosity Domains

**Wiwik Laela Mukromin**

Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar, Indonesia  
laelamukromin@unismuh.ac.id

**Mustamin Giling**

Institut Agama Islam Negeri Ternate, Indonesia  
mustamingiling@iain-ternate.ac.id

**Suf Kasman**

Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar, Indonesia  
suf.kasman@uin-alauddin.ac.id

**Meisil B Wulur**

Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar, Indonesia  
meisil@unismuh.ac.id

**Sumiati**

Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar, Indonesia  
Sumiati@unismuh.ac.id

---

Corresponding Author: Wiwik Laela Mukromin

Article history: Received: July 20, 2026 | Revised: August 29, 2026 | Available Online: September 13, 2026

---

## Abstract

This study examines Umrah as an experience-based learning cycle that reshapes pilgrims' religiosity, integrating a da'wah-communication framework with the phenomenology of religious experience to explain the mechanisms behind it. An explanatory sequential mixed-methods design measured five religiosity dimensions — practice, belief, knowledge, feeling, and effect — among 329 Umrah pilgrims from Makassar City using paired retrospective before-and-after measures, followed by in-depth interviews with 45 informants. The Wilcoxon Signed-Rank test showed four dimensions increased significantly ( $r = 0.15$  to  $0.62$ ), while religious knowledge declined slightly but significantly, challenging the assumption that the cycle strengthens all domains at once. Qualitative data, mapped onto Kolb's four phases, showed that manasik training delivers procedural content before departure, while the muthawif acts in situ as a facilitator, reframing procedures as meaningful and easing ritual anxiety rather than adding factual knowledge, which helps explain why affective and behavioral change outpaced cognitive change. Pilgrims' experiences are positioned as an emic articulation of categories already documented in the phenomenology of religious experience. The study proposes experiential religious values education as an initial conceptual contribution, framing intensive rituals as a natural laboratory for Kolb's cycle in an Islamic context. A single-group retrospective design without a control group, memory bias, and a self-developed instrument not validated by factor analysis restricts causal and psychometric claims. Further research with follow-up measurements three to six months later and a validated scale is recommended to test whether these patterns persist over time.

**Keywords:** experiential learning cycle; religious values education; religiosity; Umrah; da'wah; direct experience

## Introduction

Umrah holds a special place in the lives of contemporary Muslims. This ritual requires material and physical preparation, but it also involves powerful symbolic, emotional, social, and communicative experiences. In urban communities, participation in Umrah is intertwined with the religious travel industry, digital promotion, pilgrim communities, the roles of ustadz and *muthawif*, and the practice of sharing experiences on social media. Umrah, therefore, is not merely a form of religious mobility or spiritual tourism. It can be understood as a space for learning religious values that occurs before departure, during worship in the Holy Land, and after pilgrims return to their social environments.

Previous studies on Umrah have followed two trends. The first trend frames Umrah within the context of spiritual tourism, middle-class lifestyles, and the commodification of religion.<sup>1</sup> The second trend links religiosity to the formation of self-concept or spiritual *coping* among specific groups.<sup>2</sup> Limiting this review to these four pre-2020 references would overstate the novelty of this study. Studies from 2022–2026 indicate that Islamic ritual practices and religious experiences remain active areas of research. An ethnographic study of fasting and local pilgrimages in Aceh documents rituals as religious dispositions that are embodied and reproduced through communal memory.<sup>3</sup> A phenomenological study in Makassar, the same city as this research, examines how paid da'wah events negotiate the religious identities of Generation Z.<sup>4</sup> Another study on Indonesian Muslims explores religious experiences as an inner resource

---

<sup>1</sup> S K Dewi, "Trend Wisata Umrah: Antara Meneladani Sunnah Dan Turisme Spiritual," *Empirisma* 26, no. 2 (2017); Sucipto, "Umrah Sebagai Gaya Hidup, Eksistensi Diri Dan Komoditas Industri: Menyaksikan Perubahan Keagamaan Warga Kota," *Kontekstualita: Jurnal Penelitian Sosial Keagamaan* 28, no. 1 (2013).

<sup>2</sup> D Y Muchtar, "Peran Religiusitas Dalam Pembentukan Konsep Diri Remaja," *Tazkiya Journal of Psychology* 3, no. 2 (2015); H Hasanah and A Fadhilah, "Problem Religiusitas Dan Coping Spiritual Pada Anak Berhadapan Hukum," *SAWWA: Jurnal Studi Gender* 13, no. 1 (2018).

<sup>3</sup> Safira Mustaqilla et al., "Ritual Contestation in Contemporary Acehese Islam: An Ethnography of Fasting and Pilgrimage Practices in Blang Pu'uk, Nagan Raya, Aceh, Indonesia," *El-Usrah* 8, no. 2 (2025): 1254–72, <https://doi.org/10.22373/ujhk.v8i2.27103>.

<sup>4</sup> St Nasriah et al., "Negotiating Sharia Ethics in Paid Hotel Da'wah: A Phenomenological Study of Generation Z in Makassar," *El-Usrah* 9, no. 1 (2026): 329–45, <https://doi.org/10.22373/ujhk.v9i1.32943>.

amid hardship<sup>5</sup> and as the foundation of communal resilience during crises.<sup>6</sup> Interview-based studies of the pilgrimage experience itself have also appeared: a Swedish project documenting how Muslims prepare for and experience the *Hajj*,<sup>7</sup> and fieldwork in South Sulawesi showing how completing the *Hajj* reshapes both religiosity and social recognition.<sup>8</sup>

Meanwhile, recent quantitative studies on the umrah in Indonesia have focused on customer satisfaction within the framework of travel service marketing,<sup>9</sup> Rather than on changes in religiosity or value education, a focus mirrored in religious-tourism research elsewhere, which centers on motivation, satisfaction, and loyalty.<sup>10</sup> None of the studies in this review combine repeated-measure multidimensional religiosity instruments with qualitative explanations of specific da'wah mechanisms in the context of the umrah. The gap addressed by this study is therefore narrower than simply "under-researched religious experiences." The gap lies in the absence of a combination of quantitative measurement and qualitative analysis of da'wah mechanisms in the context of Umrah, rather than in studies of Islamic religious experiences in general, which have already been extensively researched.

In the study of da'wah, media is not limited to mass communication channels or technological platforms. Media also takes the form of encounters, visits, interpersonal relationships, and social practices through which religious messages are internalized.<sup>11</sup> The framing of *muthawif*s and da'is as *opinion leaders* specifically refers to the *two-step*

---

<sup>5</sup> Festa Yumpi Rahmanawati, M A Subandi, and Akif Khilmiyah, "Exploration of Inner Resources in Religious Experience of Muslim Family Caregivers for Autistic Children in Indonesia," *The International Journal of Religion and Spirituality in Society* 13, no. 1 (2022): 1–15, <https://doi.org/10.18848/2154-8633/CGP/v13i01/1-15>.

<sup>6</sup> M Ridwan et al., "Experience of the Muslim Community Resistance during COVID-19 in Moluccas, Indonesia," *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities* 30, no. 4 (2022): 1991–2011, <https://doi.org/10.47836/pjssh.30.4.27>.

<sup>7</sup> Göran Larsson and Simon Sorgenfrei, "'How Is One Supposed to Sleep When the Ka'ba Is Over There?' Empirical Data on Swedish Muslims Performing the Hajj," *Journal of Muslims in Europe* 17, no. 1 (2021): 1–22, <https://doi.org/10.1163/22117954-bja10036>.

<sup>8</sup> Syamsurijal et al., "Trans People Making the Hajj to Mecca: Religiosity and Social Inclusion in Indonesia," *Indonesia and the Malay World* 51, no. 151 (2023): 348–63, <https://doi.org/10.1080/13639811.2023.2287861>.

<sup>9</sup> Larsson and Sorgenfrei, "'How Is One Supposed to Sleep When the Ka'ba Is Over There?' Empirical Data on Swedish Muslims Performing the Hajj."

<sup>10</sup> Mauricio Carvache-Franco et al., "Sociodemographic Aspects, Satisfaction, Loyalty, and Motivations in Religious Tourism," *Cogent Social Sciences* 10, no. 1 (2024): 2401145, <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2024.2401145>.

<sup>11</sup> Achmad Mubarak, *Komunikasi Islam: Dakwah Sebagai Komunikasi* (Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 1998); Abd. Pirol, *Komunikasi Dan Dakwah Islam* (Yogyakarta: Deepublish, 2018).

flow model, in which mediated messages are filtered and reinforced through trusted intermediaries rather than received directly from the source.<sup>12</sup> This dynamic is not exclusive to Umrah. A similar pattern was recently documented in the context of commercial da'wah in Makassar, where market logic and the aesthetics of curated spaces reshape the way young audiences receive religious messages.<sup>13</sup> These findings suggest that the opinion leader mechanism applies across da'wah settings, both formal and informal, within the same urban context.

To measure religiosity, this study adopts the five dimensions first proposed by Glock and Stark: religious practice, religious belief, religious knowledge, religious feeling, and religious effect. This dimensional approach is not an outdated legacy.<sup>14</sup> The psychology of religion continues to treat religiousness as a multidimensional construct with cognitive and affective foundations,<sup>15</sup> And researchers continue to develop and validate multidimensional religiosity measures, including scales that have been developed and tested directly in Muslim samples. Recent Indonesian work in the same vein models Muslim religious character with closely related indicators, intellect, belief, commitment, ritual, experience, and consequences, using confirmatory factor analysis.<sup>16</sup> The breakdown of religiosity into measurable dimensions remains an actively used and validated methodological strategy.

The city of Makassar provides an important context for this study due to its large number of Umrah pilgrims and its continuously evolving Umrah travel ecosystem. The dissertation on which this article is based recorded a population of 28,000 Umrah pilgrims in 2022 and surveyed 329 respondents. Field observations also reveal a community of pilgrims who maintain social ties after the Umrah, remind one another, share experiences, and support religious activities.

---

<sup>12</sup> Elihu Katz, Paul F Lazarsfeld, and Elmo Roper, *Personal Influence: The Part Played by People in the Flow of Mass Communications* (New York: Routledge, 2006).

<sup>13</sup> Charles Y Glock and Rodney Stark, *Religion and Society in Tension* (Chicago: Rand McNally, 1965).

<sup>14</sup> Robert A Emmons and Raymond F Paloutzian, "The Psychology of Religion," *Annual Review of Psychology* 54 (2003): 377–402, <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.psych.54.101601.145024>.

<sup>15</sup> Jamal Al-Menayes, "Measuring the Spiritual and Behavioral Dimensions of Religiosity in a Muslim Sample," *Asian Social Science* 12, no. 2 (2016): 158–64, <https://doi.org/10.5539/ass.v12n2p158>.

<sup>16</sup> Mami Hajaroh, Siti Irene Astuti Dwiningrum, and Rukiyati, "Development of the Theoretical Construction Model of Muslim Religious Character with Confirmatory Factor Analysis to Develop a Measurement Scale," *International Journal of Islamic Thought* 23, no. 1 (2023): 65–78, <https://doi.org/10.24035/IJIT.23.2023.257>.

The concept of "direct experience," which is further explored in this article, needs to be situated within the existing literature, rather than presented as an unprecedented finding. Experiences of divine closeness, ease, or assistance have a long genealogy in religious studies: from James's<sup>17</sup> treatment of religious experience as a distinct category of consciousness, to the concept of the numinous developed by Otto,<sup>18</sup> Maslow's peak experience.<sup>19</sup> Steinbock constructed the phenomenology of mysticism across Christian, Jewish, and Islamic traditions through the concept of verticality.<sup>20</sup> Applebaum analyzes *dhikr* in Sufi practice from a Husserlian-phenomenological perspective and describes it as an experience of being remembered by the Absolute.<sup>21</sup>

From a sociological perspective, Tavory and Winchester demonstrate that intense religious experiences characterize the early stages of an "experiential career" before routinization occurs, a framework relevant for interpreting why first-time congregants in this study's sample reported strong direct experiences.<sup>22</sup> Based on this literature, what informants described as direct experiences is not a new phenomenon. Rather, it is an emic articulation, within the context of Islamic pilgrimage in Indonesia, of a category long documented in the phenomenology and sociology of religious experience. The contribution of this article, therefore, lies not in the discovery of the phenomenon itself but in its empirical validation through quantitative measurement paired with a measurable increase in the dimension of religious feeling.

Integrating an experience-based learning cycle with religious pilgrimages is not entirely new, either. A reflective case study of pilgrimages in India and Nepal applied Kolb's learning cycle, concrete experience, reflective observation, abstract conceptualization, and active experimentation to interpret the impact of a Buddhist

---

<sup>17</sup> William James, *The Varieties of Religious Experience: A Study in Human Nature* (New York: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1902).

<sup>18</sup> Rudolf Otto, *The Idea of the Holy: An Inquiry into the Non-Rational Factor in the Idea of the Divine and Its Relation to the Rational*, ed. John W Harvey (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1923).

<sup>19</sup> Abraham H. Maslow, *Religions, Values, and Peak Experiences* (Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 1964).

<sup>20</sup> Anthony J Steinbock, *Phenomenology and Mysticism: The Verticality of Religious Experience* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2007).

<sup>21</sup> Marc Applebaum, "Remembrance: A Husserlian Phenomenology of Sufi Practice," *Journal of Speculative Philosophy* 33, no. 1 (2019): 22–40, <https://doi.org/10.5325/jspecphil.33.1.0022>.

<sup>22</sup> Iddo Tavory and Daniel Winchester, "Experiential Careers: The Routinization and De-Routinization of Religious Life," *Theory and Society* 41, no. 4 (2012): 351–73, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11186-012-9170-z>.

pilgrimage on a single pilgrim.<sup>23</sup> That study was a reflective, personal account of a single pilgrim, without structured measurements and without an Islamic ritual context. More broadly, experiential and immersive designs are increasingly theorized within religious education itself,<sup>24</sup> yet such work rarely connects them to an Islamic ritual with structured, mixed-methods measurement. This research extends the application of that framework to the context of the umrah, using paired measures of religiosity among 329 pilgrims combined with qualitative data from various categories of informants in a design that has not yet been applied to studies of experiential learning cycles within the context of Islamic rituals.

The three areas of study mentioned above, the dimension of religiosity, da'wah as a medium of expression, and the phenomenology of religious experience, can be integrated into a single conceptual model by positioning the Umrah as an experiential learning cycle, following Kolb's framework.<sup>25</sup> In this model, the stages of the Umrah ritual are mapped into four phases of learning. Concrete experience occurs through the pilgrims' physical engagement in ihram, tawaf, and *sa'i*. Reflective observation occurs when pilgrims reflect on the meaning behind these rituals. *Abstract conceptualization* occurs when explanations provided by da'i or *muthawif* reorient the pilgrims' understanding from mere procedures to spiritual and ethical meanings. *Active experimentation* occurs when pilgrims apply this understanding to their behavior and social relationships after returning from the Holy Land. The roles of the da'i and *muthawif* in this cycle are explained through the mechanism of social learning.<sup>26</sup> Both serve as behavioral models, with their messages transmitted through trusted interpersonal relationships, consistent with the logic of the two-step flow of communication.<sup>27</sup>

The five dimensions of religiosity in this model serve as measurable indicators of the learning cycle's outcomes.<sup>28</sup> Religious knowledge represents the cognitive domain.

---

<sup>23</sup> Yen Ping Ki, "A Case Study of Pilgrimage as Experiential Learning: Reflections of a Buddhist Pilgrim," *International Journal of Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage* 10, no. 1 (2022): 13–20.

<sup>24</sup> Christos Papakostas, "Faith in Frames: Constructing a Digital Game-Based Learning Framework for Religious Education," *Teaching Theology & Religion* 27, no. 4 (2024): 137–54.

<sup>25</sup> David A Kolb, Richard E Boyatzis, and Charalampos Mainemelis, "Experiential Learning Theory: Previous Research and New Directions," in *Perspectives on Thinking, Learning, and Cognitive Styles* (Routledge, 2014), 227–47.

<sup>26</sup> Albert Bandura and Richard H Walters, *Social Learning Theory*, vol. 1 (Englewood cliffs Prentice Hall, 1977).

<sup>27</sup> Katz, Lazarsfeld, and Roper, *Personal Influence: The Part Played by People in the Flow of Mass Communications*.

<sup>28</sup> Glock and Stark, *Religion and Society in Tension*.

Religious feeling represents the affective domain and inner experience. Religious practice and religious effect represent the behavioral domain (*enactment*) as the cycle's outcome. Religious belief, as a relatively well-established theological conviction before departure, is more resistant to short-term changes within a single cycle of experience. This mapping is a conceptual proxy, not an operational equivalence: the religiosity instruments used in this study were designed to measure constructs of the psychology of religion,<sup>29</sup> not learning outcomes in the technical sense commonly used in educational psychology. Interpreting the research results as evidence of a cycle of experiential learning is therefore interpretive in nature and will be critically reexamined in the Discussion section.

Based on this conceptual model, the study aims to: (1) analyze changes in the five dimensions of pilgrims' religiosity as indicators of the outcomes of the experiential learning cycle; (2) explain the roles of da'i and *muthawif* as social models that drive this cycle through interpersonal and symbolic communication; and (3) interpret *direct experience* as a concrete manifestation of the experience and reflection phases in the learning cycle. These three objectives are expected to contribute to the development of *experiential religious values education*, with intensive religious rituals such as the umrah positioned as a natural laboratory for Kolb's learning cycle within a combined Islamic context, an approach that, to the best of the literature reviewed, has not yet been applied using a *mixed-methods* design and paired measurements on a pilgrim population of this scale.

## Method

This study employs a mixed-methods design of the explanatory sequential type.<sup>30</sup> The quantitative component was conducted and analyzed first to identify patterns of change across five dimensions of religiosity. The qualitative component then explained these patterns using interview data. This sequence follows the conceptual model presented in the Introduction: quantitative data capture changes in the outcome indicators of the experience-based learning cycle,<sup>31</sup> while qualitative data explain the mechanisms through which the roles of the da'i and *muthawif*, as social models,<sup>32</sup> drive the stages of

---

<sup>29</sup> Emmons and Paloutzian, "The Psychology of Religion."

<sup>30</sup> John W Creswell and Vicki L Plano Clark, *Designing and Conducting Mixed Methods Research*, 2nd ed. (Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, 2011).

<sup>31</sup> Bandura and Walters, *Social Learning Theory*.

<sup>32</sup> Bandura and Walters, *Social Learning Theory*.

concrete experience, reflective observation, abstract conceptualization, and active experimentation.

The quantitative component is *ex post facto* and, more precisely, a single-administration retrospective pre-post design rather than a true prospective one. In one sitting after returning from the Umrah, each respondent rated their present ("after") condition and then reconstructed their pre-departure ("before") condition from memory. Both ratings, therefore, depend on recall collected at a single time point (double recall), which exposes the "before" scores to telescoping and to motivated recall, the tendency, after a salient transformative event, to remember an earlier self as less devout so that the change feels larger. This threat is revisited in the Discussion and among the study's limitations, and it conditions how the differences in Table 1 should be read.

The study population consisted of 28,000 Umrah pilgrims in Makassar City in 2022, as recorded in official data from the Head of the *Hajj* and Umrah Operations Division (PHU) of the South Sulawesi Provincial Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. For this population, Isaac and Michael's table returns a target of 329 respondents at a nominal 5% margin.<sup>33</sup> Respondents were then recruited through accidental/convenience sampling based on accessibility and willingness to participate, not through random selection.

This sequence contains a deliberate but consequential mismatch. Isaac and Michael's table presupposes probability sampling, whereas recruitment here was non-probability. Under convenience sampling, the 5% margin of error has no inferential meaning: it functions only as a heuristic for fixing a target sample size and licenses no statement about sampling error, confidence intervals, or generalization to the 28,000-pilgrim population. The findings describe patterns within the accessible sample alone.

Population criteria: having performed the Umrah in 2022, residing in Makassar, aged 20–70 years, able to read and write, and willing to participate.

The instrument measures five dimensions of religiosity: religious practice (RP), religious belief (RB), religious knowledge (RK), religious feeling (RF), and religious effect (RE), which the researchers developed themselves based on Glock and Stark's dimensional framework.<sup>34</sup> The conceptual model in the Introduction positions these five

---

<sup>33</sup> Stephen Isaac and William B Michael, *Handbook in Research and Evaluation: A Collection of Principles, Methods, and Strategies Useful in the Planning, Design, and Evaluation of Studies in Education and the Behavioral Sciences*, 3rd ed. (San Diego: EdITS, 1995).

<sup>34</sup> Glock and Stark, *Religion and Society in Tension*.

dimensions as proxies for the outcomes of the experience-based learning cycle. RK represents the cognitive domain. RF represents the affective domain. RP and RE represent the behavioral (*enactment*) domain as the cycle's outcomes.

This mapping is a conceptual proxy, not an operational equivalence. This instrument measures constructs in the psychology of religion, not *learning outcomes* in the technical sense of educational psychology. The discussion critically reexamines these limitations.

Practice, belief, feeling, and effect were measured on a five-point Likert scale combining favorable and unfavorable statements; knowledge was assessed with a true-false test. The instrument was self-developed from Glock and Stark's framework and pilot-tested on 40 respondents with 42 initial items. Item validity was judged by the corrected item-total correlation against the *r*-table critical value (critical  $r = 0.312$  at  $df = 38$ , i.e.,  $N - 2$  for the 40 pilot respondents,  $\alpha = .05$ ). Across three iterative rounds, items below this threshold were removed, leaving 13 retained items. The reported Cronbach's Alpha of 0.806 is the composite reliability of this pooled 13-item scale (Cronbach's Alpha based on standardized items = 0.806;  $N$  of items = 13), not a set of per-dimension coefficients.

Two features of this procedure bound what the instrument can claim. First, the 13 retained items are spread across five dimensions, roughly two to three items per dimension, so each subscale rests on very few indicators. Second, item validity and reliability were assessed on the pooled scale (item-total correlations against the overall total, and a single composite alpha); no factor-analytic test of the five-dimensional structure was performed. No exploratory or confirmatory factor analysis (EFA/CFA) was conducted, and per-dimension (subscale) reliabilities were not computed. With only two to three items per subscale, such coefficients would be unstable in any case. The five-dimensional structure is therefore a conceptually imposed scoring scheme, not a psychometrically confirmed factor structure, a limitation made sharper by the fact that a multidimensional religious-character model in the same national literature was validated with confirmatory factor analysis.<sup>35</sup> These constraints are restated among the study's limitations.

---

<sup>35</sup> Hajaroh, Dwiningrum, and Rukiyati, "Development of the Theoretical Construction Model of Muslim Religious Character with Confirmatory Factor Analysis to Develop a Measurement Scale."

SPSS version 25 was used to process all the data. Descriptive analysis included the mean, standard deviation, minimum, and maximum for each dimension. The Kolmogorov-Smirnov normality test showed that all pre- and post-Umrah scores across the five dimensions had significance values below 0.05. The assumption of normality for the paired-samples t-test was not met. This study, therefore, tested for differences in scores using the Wilcoxon Signed-Rank Test. The SPSS output value of 0.000 is reported as  $p < 0.001$ , in accordance with statistical reporting conventions.

Forty-five informants participated in in-depth interviews, including Umrah pilgrims, da'i/mubaligh, *muthawif*, Umrah travel agency practitioners/owners, and community leaders. The interview guide followed the four phases of Kolb's learning cycle.<sup>36</sup>, which formed the conceptual framework of this study. Questions about physical experiences during the rituals of ihram, tawaf, and *sa'i* captured the "concrete experience" phase. Questions about the meanings the informants reflected on after specific moments captured the reflective observation phase. Questions about explanations provided by da'is /*muthawifs* that altered the informants' understanding captured the abstract *conceptualization* phase. Questions about changes in behavior and social relationships after returning from Umrah captured the active experimentation phase. This structure follows the conceptual framework outlined in the Introduction rather than serving as a standalone list of thematic questions.

Beyond mapping phases, the qualitative strand treats the learning environment of Umrah itself as an object of analysis. Two components are distinguished. The *manasik*, the structured pre-departure guidance sessions, serve as the ritual's formal instructional layer, providing the procedural and factual content of the rites before departure. The *muthawif* (field guide) operates as a non-formal, in-situ facilitator during the rites, working not from a fixed syllabus but from the situations that arise. The interview guide and coding, therefore, also targeted facilitation moves: how the *muthawif* reframed procedures into meanings, managed pilgrims' anxiety about performing the rites "correctly," and timed explanations to the moment. This lets the analysis ask *how* the setting produces learning, not only whether religiosity scores moved. The distinction is carried into the Discussion.

---

<sup>36</sup>Kolb, *Experiential Learning*.

The interviews lasted 35–60 minutes and were conducted 2–4 weeks after the pilgrims returned from Umrah. Analysis followed the stages of data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing and verification.<sup>37</sup> Two researchers coded the transcripts independently, and coding discrepancies were reconciled through consensus discussion (investigator triangulation); NVivo was used to manage the coded data. Inter-coder agreement was established through this consensus process rather than a numeric coefficient: a formal Cohen's Kappa was not computed for the coded corpus, and none is reported here. This is noted as one of the study's limitations.

This study employed two forms of triangulation. Data triangulation compared findings across four categories of informants and field observation notes. Investigator triangulation involved two researchers who each coded and analyzed the data separately; consensus discussions were used to resolve differences in interpretation between them.

## **Results**

This section addresses the three research objectives through the framework of the experience-based learning cycle:<sup>38</sup> (A) Changes in the five dimensions of religiosity as indicators of the cycle's outcomes; (B) qualitative data mapped to the four phases of the cycle; and (C) direct experience as manifested in the reflection phase.

The "before" scores in this study are retrospective reconstructions, completed by respondents in the same sitting as the "after" scores, at a single time point, and using double recall (see Method). The following results, therefore, describe self-reported change rather than prospectively measured longitudinal change.

### **Changes in the Five Dimensions of Religiosity as Outcome Indicators of the Learning Cycle**

The conceptual model in the Introduction positions RK as a proxy for the cognitive domain, RF as a proxy for the affective domain, and RP-RE as a proxy for the behavioral (*enactment*) domain, with RB as a belief construct that is relatively resistant to short-term change. Table 1 presents the results of the Wilcoxon Signed-Rank test for the five dimensions.

---

<sup>37</sup> Matthew B Miles and A Michael Huberman, *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook* (sage, 1994).

<sup>38</sup> Kolb, *Experiential Learning*.

Table 1.  
Changes in the Five Dimensions of Religiosity Before and After Umrah (N=329)

| Dimension                | Domain (Kolb) | Before Umrah (SD) | After M (SD) | $\Delta M$ | Z       | p      | r                    |
|--------------------------|---------------|-------------------|--------------|------------|---------|--------|----------------------|
| Religious Practice (RP)  | Behavior      | 11.29 (1.42)      | 11.94 (1.33) | +0.65      | -9.513  | <0.001 | 0.52 (large)         |
| Religious Belief (RB)    | Belief        | 18.22 (1.86)      | 18.83 (1.84) | +0.61      | -7.348  | <0.001 | 0.41 (moderate–high) |
| Religious Knowledge (RK) | Cognitive     | 11.11 (1.30)      | 10.98 (1.20) | -0.13      | -2.775  | 0.006  | 0.15 (small)         |
| Religious Feeling (RF)   | Affective     | 16.00 (1.56)      | 16.62 (1.73) | +0.62      | -8.000  | <0.001 | 0.44 (moderate)      |
| Religious Effect (RE)    | Behavior      | 24.43 (3.08)      | 25.88 (3.02) | +1.45      | -11.216 | <0.001 | 0.62 (large)         |

$$r = Z/\sqrt{N}$$

The behavioral domain (RP, RE) had the greatest effect because it is the final phase of the cycle, in which internalized meanings take the form of actions. The affective domain (RF) produced a moderate effect. The belief domain (RB) produced a moderate-to-large effect, with the highest proportion of ties (211 out of 329 respondents), consistent with its position as a construct already established before departure.

The cognitive domain (RK) moved in the opposite direction: a small but significant decrease ( $r = 0.15$ ). Sixty-six respondents showed a decrease, 37 showed an increase, and 226 remained unchanged. These findings challenge the assumption of a linear learning cycle from cognition to behavior. Section B suggests a reason grounded in the setting's instructional design: the procedural and factual content of the rites appears to have been largely delivered before departure, in the *manasik*, leaving little cognitive headroom, while the in-situ *muthawif* guidance in this sample reoriented the *meaning* of rituals rather than transferring new facts. The Discussion examines this alongside competing explanations (regression toward the mean, the true-false versus Likert format, and retrospective over-estimation of prior knowledge).

#### Four Phases of the Learning Cycle in Qualitative Data

Concrete Experience. The physical experience during the ritual that makes up this phase consists largely of exhaustion, rather than dramatic spiritual sensations. Informant 1 recalls the tawaf:

"I was actually exhausted. My feet hurt, it was hot, and it was crowded. But there was one moment, maybe during the fifth or sixth circuit, when I looked at the

Ka'bah, and suddenly my body seemed to pause for a moment, even though my feet kept moving."

Another informant mixed exhaustion with irritation, before a single moment interrupted both:

"I was tired. Honestly, I was exhausted. And I got a little upset because someone pushed me. But on the last lap, I saw the Ka'bah from a distance. Suddenly, I remembered my father, who had passed away."

Reflective Observation. Reflection immediately followed the concrete moment.

Informant 1 reflected on her tears in front of the Ka'bah:

"I cried not because something extraordinary happened. It was more because I felt... small. At home, I often feel like I have to be in control of everything. There, I realized that, as it turns out, many things are indeed beyond my control."

Another informant linked a similar moment to a lost personal connection:

"What made me cry wasn't just the place itself. I think it was because, only once I was there, did I realize I was in a place I'd only ever seen in photos, and that the person I wanted to pray for was no longer someone I could take there."

Abstract Conceptualization. The explanations provided by the *da'i/muthawif* reoriented the informant's understanding from procedure toward the meaning of the *social learning* mechanism, which operates through the two-step flow of communication<sup>39</sup>.

Before the tawaf, Informant 1's *muthawif* advised:

"Ladies, don't get so caught up in counting the circuits that you forget who you're facing. Those seven circuits aren't just a number, they're a practice to bring our hearts back to Allah time and time again."

During the *sa'i*, Informant 2, a *muthawif*, explained tawakal through the story of

Siti Hajar:

"Gentlemen, look at Siti Hajar's struggle. She didn't just wait passively for help. She sought it out. So tawakal comes after making an effort; it doesn't replace that effort."

*Muthawif* informant 3 eased social pressure regarding spiritual devotion:

"Don't measure how close you are to Allah by the number of tears you shed. Sometimes the calmest person is actually the one learning to surrender themselves."

All three share a common pattern: the *muthawif*'s explanation does not add new facts but rather reorients the interpretive framework for something the informant already knows procedurally. This pattern corresponds to a slight decrease in the RK in Section A. The change appears to occur at the level of meaning, rather than as a measurable addition of factual knowledge.

Active Experimentation. A change in behavior after returning from the umrah closes the cycle. Informant 1 held back her anger toward her child:

"At that moment, I was about to scold him, but then I remembered what the *muthawif* had said earlier: 'Invite your heart along.' I took a deep breath first. I said, 'Mom is worried, not angry.'"

Informant 3 chose to call rather than reply to the message angrily:

"I remember the *muthawif*'s words: 'What are you bringing home?' I thought, 'I'm coming back from umrah, but am I still treating people the same way?' So I ended up calling."

All three emphasized that this change is gradual, not an instant transformation. Informant 2 described himself as "still practicing." Informant 3 admitted, "I can still get angry, but now there's a pause before I react." The large effect sizes for RP and RE (Part A) capture these tangible changes at the population level, although the proportion of "*ties*" in RE remains high (160 out of 329). The changes are not uniform across all respondents.

Direct Experience and the Reflective Phase. Direct experience of assistance or a sense of closeness falls within the phase of reflective observation and is related to religious feeling (Part A). All three informants maintained epistemic distance when interpreting these experiences. Informant 1, who got lost in Medina:

"You could call it a coincidence. I don't want to call it a miracle either. But to me, at that moment, it felt as if Allah was making things easier."

Informant 2, upon successfully entering the crowded Rawdah:

"I don't want to say it was definitely because of my prayer. We don't know. But I felt one thing: when I stopped forcing it, the path suddenly opened up."

This caution appears consistently throughout the available transcripts, affirming the position of direct experience as an emic category, not a metaphysical claim whose truth is subject to testing.

## Discussion

This discussion examines three research objectives within the framework of the experience-based learning cycle,<sup>40</sup> as outlined in the Introduction, and situates the findings within the most relevant body of literature on the subject.

### Multidimensional Change in the Learning Cycle Framework

The effect size patterns in Table 1 form a clear hierarchy: the largest in the behavioral domain (RP, RE), moderate in the affective domain (RF), and the smallest in the cognitive domain (RK). Kistoro et al., in a study of 15 Islamic Religious Education

---

<sup>40</sup> D A Kolb, *Experiential Learning: Experience as the Source of Learning and Development* (Prentice Hall, 1984).

teachers, found a similar pattern: the application of experiential learning was "easier with less complex material," while complex conceptual material required additional pedagogical competencies beyond mere experience.<sup>41</sup> Muhamad et al. reinforced this pattern among students at the University of Malaya: direct experience facilitated shifts in attitude and understanding, rather than an increase in technical knowledge.<sup>42</sup>

Religious rituals function as dispositions that are embodied and socially reproduced, not merely as knowledge absorbed cognitively, a central claim of the lived-religion tradition, which locates religiosity in everyday embodied practice rather than in doctrine alone.<sup>43</sup> Mustaqilla et al. examined local fasting and pilgrimage rituals in Aceh and documented religious dispositions embedded in the body and reinforced through communal memory.<sup>44</sup> This reading explains why RP and RE show the largest effect sizes: the Umrah ritual, like the local rituals studied by Mustaqilla et al., shapes dispositional actions through repeated bodily experiences rather than merely through verbal instructions.

Religious feeling aligns with the broader literature on religiosity within the Indonesian Muslim community. Yusuf and Putri, in their study of the Majelis Taklim community, found that gratitude is a significant emotional correlate of religiosity; psychological appreciation and commitment to faith reinforce one another rather than standing alone. Yusuf and Putri emphasize that a correlational design does not allow for strong causal claims; the same caution applies to this study.<sup>45</sup> Parallel work in Islamic primary education treats gratitude as an affective character outcome deliberately

---

<sup>41</sup> Hanif Cahyo Adi Kistoro, Eva Latipah, and Norhapizah Mohd Burhan, "Probing Experiential Learning Approach in Islamic Religious Education," *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 9, no. 2 (2023): 157–68.

<sup>42</sup> A Muhamad et al., "Instilling Islamic Values of Environmental Sustainability through Experiential Learning: A Case Study of Revealed Knowledge and Natural Phenomena's Students," *Asia Pacific Journal of Educators and Education* 39, no. 2 (2024): 219–48, <https://doi.org/10.21315/apjee2024.39.2.12>.

<sup>43</sup> Meredith B McGuire, *Lived Religion: Faith and Practice in Everyday Life* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011).

<sup>44</sup> Mustaqilla et al., "Ritual Contestation in Contemporary Acehnese Islam: An Ethnography of Fasting and Pilgrimage Practices in Blang Pu'uk, Nagan Raya, Aceh, Indonesia."

<sup>45</sup> G T P Yusuf and P K Putri, "Gratitude as an Affective Foundation of Religiosity: Evidence from Indonesian Majelis Taklim Communities," *Journal of Educational, Health and Community Psychology* 15, no. 1 (n.d.).

cultivated through pedagogy and local cultural practice, reinforcing the reading of religious feeling as something that can be shaped through education.<sup>46</sup>

### **Umrah as a Non-Formal Learning Environment: *Manasik* Design and the *Muthawif* as Facilitator**

Reading the ritual as a non-formal learning environment clarifies where the change actually comes from. The setting has two instructional layers, each with a different function. The *manasik*, held before departure, is the formal layer: it transmits the procedural sequence of the rites, the number of tawaf circuits, the prescribed supplications, and the order of *sa'i* so that pilgrims arrive already knowing what to do. Informant 1 makes the point directly, recalling that she "already knew" tawaf was seven circuits from the *manasik* at home. The *muthawif* supplies the second, non-formal layer during the rites, and it is here that the interviews locate the decisive shift.

Across the three transcripts, the *muthawif* operates less as a lecturer than as a facilitator of experiential learning in Kolb's sense: someone who adds little content but helps the pilgrim convert a concrete, often uncomfortable experience into reflection and then into a reusable principle.<sup>47</sup> Three facilitation moves recur. The first is a reframing procedure into meaning. Before tawaf, the *muthawif* told Informant 1 not to get so absorbed in counting circuits that she forgot whom she was facing, recasting a counted routine as an exercise in returning the heart to God. The second is lowering the affective cost of learning: told that forgetting a supplication was no cause for panic because God does not wait for perfect memorization, Informant 1 stopped performing the rite out of fear of error, thereby reducing performance anxiety, a precondition for reflective rather than rote engagement. The third is calibrating the intervention to the moment: the pivotal explanations arrived just in time and in place at the threshold of tawaf, at Shafa before *sa'i*, while donning ihram rather than as decontextualized instruction.

The *muthawif*'s credibility, and therefore the uptake of these moves, rested on modeled disposition rather than on assertion of authority. Informant 3 came to trust her guide precisely because he would decline to answer until he was sure, saying he would check first, and because repeated questioning met patience rather than irritation. This is

<sup>46</sup> Nur Kholik Afandi and Zurqoni, "Teachers' Strategies in Cultivating Gratitude Character through Islamic Education and Local Cultural Practices in Primary Schools: A Qualitative Approach," *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 9, no. 2 (2026): 445–60, <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v9i2.444>.

<sup>47</sup> Kolb, *Experiential Learning: Experience as the Source of Learning and Development*.

the social-learning mechanism at work.<sup>48</sup> influence travels through a trusted model embedded in the pilgrim's immediate network, which is also why the informants traced their turning points to specific *muthawif* utterances rather than to general *manasik* material.

This reading reframes the study's central pattern. If the facilitation targeted meaning while the procedural facts had already been delivered in the *manasik*, then the domains most exposed to the *muthawif*'s work, the affective and behavioral, should move most. At the same time, the cognitive domain, already near its ceiling and receiving no new factual input, should barely move. That is the profile in Table 1. On this account, the study does not merely map religiosity outcomes onto Kolb's stages after the fact; it identifies the mechanism as a facilitated, non-formal learning process that produces the outcomes and predicts their uneven distribution across domains.

### **Anomalies in Religious Knowledge: Interpreting Deviations from Linear Models**

As the preceding section argued, the small but significant decrease in RK is better read as a product of the learning environment's design than as a breakdown of the cycle. The qualitative data converge on the same point: across all three informants, the *muthawif* reoriented the framework of meaning around procedures the pilgrims already knew, rather than adding new facts. If the premise of Kistoro et al. is correct, then the transmission of factual knowledge requires a pedagogical approach beyond experience alone.<sup>49</sup> Then the Umrah rituals, which structurally resemble experiential learning without explicit cognitive instructional components, are not designed to increase scores in this domain.

Three other explanations remain worthy of consideration in parallel, as this study did not test any single explanation in isolation. The true-false format in the RK differs from the Likert scale used in the other four dimensions, which are more susceptible to regression toward the mean, especially since the "pre-test" scores on this dimension were relatively high ( $M = 11.11$ ), leaving little room for improvement. The retrospective nature of the "before" scores also raises the possibility that respondents may have overestimated their past religious knowledge when recalling it, meaning that memory bias operates in the opposite direction from what is typically assumed on other dimensions. Tahom and Srisophon, who examined shifts in the religious ideology of Generation Z in Thailand,

---

<sup>48</sup> Bandura and Walters, *Social Learning Theory*.

<sup>49</sup> Kistoro, Latipah, and Burhan, "Probing Experiential Learning Approach in Islamic Religious Education."

noted the same limitations in self-report data: the potential for social desirability or selective memory.<sup>50</sup> This vulnerability is not unique to this study but rather a structural challenge in self-report-based research on religiosity in general.

### **Da'wah as a Driving Mechanism: Modeling and the Two-Step Flow**

*Muthawifs* reorient the congregation's understanding through the social learning mechanism,<sup>51</sup> which operates via trusted intermediaries in the two-step flow model. Katz and Lazarsfeld emphasize that media messages are not received directly but are filtered through figures embedded in the audience's personal networks.<sup>52</sup> This pattern is clearly evident in all three informants: they cited specific statements made by their *muthawifs* rather than general *manasik* material as the turning point in their understanding.

This mechanism explains how the message of da'wah is transmitted from the *muthawif* to the congregation. It does not, however, explain why changes in the affective and behavioral domains are more pronounced than those in the cognitive domain, a question that has been addressed in Section A through the literature on experiential learning and embodied rituals.

### **Direct Experience: The Reflective Phase in the Phenomenological Map**

All three informants consistently maintained epistemic distance when interpreting their direct experiences. This caution aligns with categories long documented in the phenomenology of religious experience: religious consciousness as a distinct category,<sup>53</sup> the numinous,<sup>54</sup> verticality across mystical traditions,<sup>55</sup> and the experience of being remembered by the Absolute in Sufi dhikr.<sup>56</sup> Tavory and Winchester add a framework directly relevant to this sample: the intensity of religious experience characterizes the early stages of the "experiential career," before routinization occurs.<sup>57</sup> This is consistent with the three informants' status as first-time worshippers.

---

<sup>50</sup> Utis Tahom and Thongchai Srisophon, "Religious Ideology Trends in the Eyes of the New Generation: Conflict, Reinterpretation, and Faith-Based Discrimination," *Human Behavior, Development and Society* 26, no. 3 (2025): 487–501, <https://doi.org/10.62370/hbds.v26i3.280842>.

<sup>51</sup> Bandura and Walters, *Social Learning Theory*.

<sup>52</sup> Katz, Lazarsfeld, and Roper, *Personal Influence: The Part Played by People in the Flow of Mass Communications*.

<sup>53</sup> James, *The Varieties of Religious Experience: A Study in Human Nature*.

<sup>54</sup> Otto, *The Idea of the Holy: An Inquiry into the Non-Rational Factor in the Idea of the Divine and Its Relation to the Rational*.

<sup>55</sup> Steinbock, *Phenomenology and Mysticism: The Verticality of Religious Experience*.

<sup>56</sup> Applebaum, "Remembrance: A Husserlian Phenomenology of Sufi Practice."

<sup>57</sup> Tavory and Winchester, "Experiential Careers: The Routinization and De-Routinization of Religious Life."

The application of the Kolb cycle in the context of pilgrimage has one precedent: a single reflective narrative of a Buddhist pilgrimage in India and Nepal that maps a pilgrim's experience across all four phases of Kolb and links their motivations to Maslow's hierarchy of needs.<sup>58</sup> That precedent is generative and exploratory for a single pilgrim, without structured measurement, outside the Islamic context. This study extends the same framework to a paired measurement of 329 pilgrims, combined with cross-informant interviews, thereby enabling verification of patterns at the population level. The same limitation applies to both: neither the previous study nor this study can claim causal generalizations without a controlled experimental design.

### **Alternative Explanations to Consider**

The study population consists of individuals who voluntarily chose to participate in a group umrah pilgrimage, who most likely already possessed relatively high religious motivation before departure. This pattern suggests that causality runs partly from motivation to the decision to perform umrah, rather than solely from umrah to increased religiosity. The design of this study cannot distinguish between these two directions of influence.

"Before" and "after" scores collected in the same sitting, immediately after a major religious ritual, give respondents a psychological incentive to recall a "less religious" past so that the transformation feels coherent, a form of motivated recall, compounded by telescoping when the remembered past is shifted in time. This is the threat flagged in the Method: with both ratings drawn from a single time point, part of the "improvement" in Table 1 may be an artifact of how the past is remembered rather than of change itself. Tahom and Srisophon acknowledge similar limitations in their study, indicating that this vulnerability is a structural feature of retrospective, self-report studies of religiosity, rather than a weakness unique to this study.<sup>59</sup>

### **Methodological Limitations and Comparison with Similar Designs**

The single-group pre-post design with the Wilcoxon test is consistent with several other religious intervention studies: the effect of reciting Qur'anic verses on depression symptoms in cancer patients,<sup>60</sup> and the effect of religious singing on children's vocabulary;<sup>61</sup> both relied on the same nonparametric test because the data were not

---

<sup>58</sup> Ki, "A Case Study of Pilgrimage as Experiential Learning: Reflections of a Buddhist Pilgrim."

<sup>59</sup> Tahom and Srisophon, "Religious Ideology Trends in the Eyes of the New Generation: Conflict, Reinterpretation, and Faith-Based Discrimination."

<sup>60</sup> Farhan Ahmed et al., "Effect of the Quranic Verses Recitation on Depressive Symptoms among Cancer Patients at Tertiary Care Hospital, Karachi," *Journal of the Liaquat University of Medical and Health Sciences* 23, no. 3 (2024): 244–48, <https://doi.org/10.22442/jlumhs.2024.01054>.

<sup>61</sup> N Nurhayati et al., "Enhancing Children's English Vocabulary through Religious Singing Activities in the Era 4.0," *Journal of Ecohumanism* 3, no. 3 (2024): 1832–37, <https://doi.org/10.62754/joe.v3i3.3584>.

normally distributed. This similarity in approach confirms that the choice of test in this study is a commonly used methodology.

The lack of a control group in these studies poses the same limitation across all of them: none of them can distinguish the effects of the intervention from those due solely to the passage of time. Loma-Ramos et al., who studied the resilience of family caregivers of patients with dementia, partially addressed this limitation by adding a follow-up measurement three months after the intervention, confirming that the observed effects persisted beyond the immediate measurement period.<sup>62</sup> This study did not employ a similar follow-up design; qualitative interviews took place 2–4 weeks after return, but quantitative "post-intervention" scores were collected only once. This limitation restricts the ability to distinguish lasting changes from short-term post-ritual euphoria and points to a concrete direction for future research: follow-up measurements 3–6 months after Umrah would allow verification of whether the patterns in Table 1 represent persistent RK anomalies or change over time.

The accidental sampling technique limits quantitative generalizations solely to patterns within the accessible sample. The qualitative data available for verification in this article is limited to three informants categorized as first-time pilgrims and does not yet include the perspectives of *da'i/muthawif*, travel agents, or community leaders, who were also among the 45 informants in this study.

Measurement and coding carry further limitations. The religiosity instrument was self-developed and, after item reduction, retained only 13 items across five dimensions, with two to three items per dimension. Its five-factor structure was never tested with EFA or CFA, and only a single composite Cronbach's Alpha (0.806) is available, rather than per-dimension reliabilities. The five dimensions should therefore be read as a conceptual scoring scheme, not a validated factor structure, and the small item counts leave each subdimension, especially the true-false knowledge score, at the center of the anomaly discussed above, vulnerable to instability. On the qualitative side, although two researchers coded independently and reconciled differences by consensus, no numeric inter-coder reliability coefficient (such as Cohen's Kappa) was computed for the corpus; agreement rests on consensus rather than a reported statistic. Future work should rebuild

---

<sup>62</sup> Sara Loma-Ramos et al., "Effectiveness of a Group Intervention to Enhance Resilience and Improve the Well-Being of Family Caregivers of Dementia Patients," *Frontiers in Psychiatry* 16 (2025): 1702324, <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsy.2025.1702324>.

the scale with a larger item pool and formal factor-analytic validation, and should report inter-coder reliability quantitatively.

## Conclusion

This study documents uneven changes in religiosity among 329 Umrah pilgrims in Makassar. Four dimensions (religious practice, belief, feeling, and effect) rose significantly, with effect sizes ranging from small to large. Religious knowledge fell slightly but significantly, a pattern that contradicts Kolb's experiential learning cycle, which predicts simultaneous growth across all domains.

Qualitative data explain the anomaly through the ritual's structure as a non-formal learning environment. The *manasik* session delivers procedural content before departure. The *muthawif* then works on-site, reorienting the meaning of rites pilgrims already know rather than teaching new facts. This division of labor matches the experiential-learning literature: experience shapes attitudes and behavior more than it transfers complex knowledge.

The study met all three objectives. It mapped changes across five religiosity dimensions as outcome indicators of the learning cycle. It explained how *da'i* and *muthawif* function as social models who drive that cycle through interpersonal and symbolic communication. And it positioned direct experience as a concrete phase within Kolb's cycle, not an isolated phenomenon in the phenomenology of religious experience.

The term "experience-based religious values education," proposed here, does not replace *da'wah*-communication studies. It offers Kolb's cycle as a unifying frame for mechanisms that *da'wah* studies and the phenomenology of religious experience have described separately. The concept remains provisional and needs to be tested against other religious rituals before researchers can treat it as established.

Several limits constrain these claims. The single-group, retrospective pre-post design lacks a control group and follow-up measurement. The researchers built the scale without factor-analytic validation, and the qualitative coding carries no numeric inter-coder coefficient. Future work should measure outcomes 3-6 months after Umrah, validate the scale, and report inter-coder reliability, then test whether the knowledge anomaly and other patterns persist over time.

### **Acknowledgments**

The authors would like to express their sincere gratitude to Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar for the institutional support provided throughout this research. The authors also extend their appreciation to the relevant institutions and research participants for their cooperation, access, and willingness to provide valuable information during data collection. Their support and participation were essential to the completion of this study.

### **Ethical Statement**

This study was conducted with institutional research permission from the Institute for Research and Community Engagement (Lembaga Penelitian dan Pengabdian kepada Masyarakat/LPPM), Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar, as documented in Letter No. B-2127/Un. 06/LPM/PP.00.9/3/2023, concerning a recommendation for research permission in Makassar City. Before data collection, participants were informed about the purpose and nature of the study, the voluntary nature of their participation, and the confidentiality of the information they provided. Consent to participate was obtained before data collection. Participants were also informed that their participation was voluntary and that they could decline to answer any question or withdraw from the study without consequence.

### **Conflict of Interest Statement**

The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest related to the research, authorship, or publication of this manuscript.

### **Funding**

This research received no external funding.

### **Author Contributions**

Wiwik Laela Mukromin: Conceptualization, Methodology, Investigation, Data curation, Formal analysis, Writing original draft. Mustamin Giling: Methodology, Supervision, Formal analysis, Writing review and editing. Suf Kasman: Conceptualization, Supervision, Validation, Writing review and editing. Meisil B Wulur: Investigation, Data curation, Visualization, Writing review and editing. Sumiati: Investigation, Data curation, Validation, Writing – review and editing. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

### **Declaration of Generative AI in Scientific Writing**

During the preparation of this manuscript, the authors used ChatGPT (OpenAI) as an AI-based language and writing assistant. ChatGPT was used to support manuscript preparation, including language refinement, sentence restructuring, and improvement of academic clarity. The tool was not used to generate or fabricate research data, research findings, or scholarly evidence. All AI-assisted content was critically reviewed, revised, and validated by the authors. The authors retain full responsibility for the accuracy, originality, interpretation, and integrity of the manuscript and its contents.

## Bibliography

- Afandi, Nur Kholik, and Zurqoni. "Teachers' Strategies in Cultivating Gratitude Character through Islamic Education and Local Cultural Practices in Primary Schools: A Qualitative Approach." *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 9, no. 2 (2026): 445-60. <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v9i2.444>.  
<https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v9i2.444>
- Ahmed, Farhan, Afshan Nazly, Yasmin Noorali Amarsi, and Shahzad Bashir. "Effect of the Quranic Verses Recitation on Depressive Symptoms among Cancer Patients at Tertiary Care Hospital, Karachi." *Journal of the Liaquat University of Medical and Health Sciences* 23, no. 3 (2024): 244-48. <https://doi.org/10.22442/jlumhs.2024.01054>.  
<https://doi.org/10.22442/jlumhs.2024.01054>
- Al-Menayes, Jamal. "Measuring the Spiritual and Behavioral Dimensions of Religiosity in a Muslim Sample." *Asian Social Science* 12, no. 2 (2016): 158-64. <https://doi.org/10.5539/ass.v12n2p158>.  
<https://doi.org/10.5539/ass.v12n2p158>
- Applebaum, Marc. "Remembrance: A Husserlian Phenomenology of Sufi Practice." *Journal of Speculative Philosophy* 33, no. 1 (2019): 22-40. <https://doi.org/10.5325/jspecphil.33.1.0022>.  
<https://doi.org/10.5325/jspecphil.33.1.0022>
- Bandura, Albert. *Social Learning Theory*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1977.
- Carvache-Franco, Mauricio, Otto Regalado-Pezúa, Orly Carvache-Franco and Wilmer Carvache-Franco. "Sociodemographic Aspects, Satisfaction, Loyalty, and Motivations in Religious Tourism." *Cogent Social Sciences* 10, no. 1 (2024): art. 2401145. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2024.2401145>.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2024.2401145>
- Creswell, John W., and Vicki L. Plano Clark. *Designing and Conducting Mixed Methods Research*. 2nd ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, 2011.
- Dewi, S. K. "Trend Wisata Umrah: Antara Meneladani Sunnah dan Turisme Spiritual." *Empirisma* 26, no. 2 (2017). <https://doi.org/10.30762/empirisma.v26i2.691>
- Emmons, Robert A., and Raymond F. Paloutzian. "The Psychology of Religion." *Annual Review of Psychology* 54 (2003): 377-402. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.psych.54.101601.145024>.  
<https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.psych.54.101601.145024>
- Glock, Charles Y., and Rodney Stark. *Religion and Society in Tension*. Chicago: Rand McNally, 1965.
- Hajaroh, Mami, Siti Irene Astuti Dwiningrum, and Rukiyati. "Development of the Theoretical Construction Model of Muslim Religious Character with Confirmatory Factor Analysis to Develop a Measurement Scale." *International Journal of Islamic Thought* 23, no. 1 (2023): 65-78. <https://doi.org/10.24035/IJIT.23.2023.257>.  
<https://doi.org/10.24035/ijit.23.2023.257>

- Hasanah, H., and A. Fadhilah. "Problem Religiusitas dan Coping Spiritual pada Anak Berhadapan Hukum." *SAWWA: Jurnal Studi Gender* 13, no. 1 (2018). <https://doi.org/10.21580/sa.v13i1.2474>
- Isaac, Stephen, and William B. Michael. *Handbook in Research and Evaluation: A Collection of Principles, Methods, and Strategies Useful in the Planning, Design, and Evaluation of Studies in Education and the Behavioral Sciences*. 3rd ed. San Diego: EdITS, 1995.
- James, William. *The Varieties of Religious Experience: A Study in Human Nature*. New York: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1902. <https://doi.org/10.1037/10004-000>
- Katz, Elihu, Paul F. Lazarsfeld, and Elmo Roper. *Personal Influence: The Part Played by People in the Flow of Mass Communications*. 1955. Reprint, New York: Routledge, 2006.
- Ki, Yen Ping. "A Case Study of Pilgrimage as Experiential Learning: Reflections of a Buddhist Pilgrim." *International Journal of Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage* 10, no. 1 (2022): 13-20.
- Kistoro, Hanif Cahyo Adi, Eva Latipah, and Norhapizah Mohd Burhan. "Probing Experiential Learning Approach in Islamic Religious Education." *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 9, no. 2 (2023): 157-68. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v9i2.24374>
- Kolb, David A. *Experiential Learning: Experience as the Source of Learning and Development*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1984.
- Larsson, Göran, and Simon Sorgenfrei. "'How Is One Supposed to Sleep When the Ka'ba Is Over There?' Empirical Data on Swedish Muslims Performing the Hajj." *Journal of Muslims in Europe* 17, no. 1 (2021): 1-22. <https://doi.org/10.1163/22117954-bja10036>. <https://doi.org/10.1163/22117954-bja10036>
- Loma-Ramos, Sara, Elena Fernández-Martínez, Alberto González-García, Laura Bello-Corral, and Leticia Sánchez-Valdeón. "Effectiveness of a Group Intervention to Enhance Resilience and Improve the Well-Being of Family Caregivers of Dementia Patients." *Frontiers in Psychiatry* 16 (2025): art. 1702324. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsy.2025.1702324>. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsy.2025.1702324>
- Maslow, Abraham H. *Religions, Values, and Peak-Experiences*. Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 1964.
- McGuire, Meredith B. *Lived Religion: Faith and Practice in Everyday Life*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Miles, Matthew B., and A. Michael Huberman. *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook*. 2nd ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, 1994.
- Mubarak, Achmad. *Komunikasi Islam: Dakwah sebagai Komunikasi*. Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 1998.
- Muchtar, D. Y. "Peran Religiusitas dalam Pembentukan Konsep Diri Remaja." *Tazkiya Journal of Psychology* 3, no. 2 (2015). <https://doi.org/10.15408/tazkiya.v20i2.9165>
- Muhamad, Asmawati, Shahidra Abdul Khalil, Siti Arni Basir, and Muhamad Alihanafiah Norasid. "Instilling Islamic Values of Environmental Sustainability through

- Experiential Learning: A Case Study of Revealed Knowledge and Natural Phenomena's Students." *Asia Pacific Journal of Educators and Education* 39, no. 2 (2024): 219-48. <https://doi.org/10.21315/apjee2024.39.2.12>.  
<https://doi.org/10.21315/apjee2024.39.2.12>
- Mustaqilla, Safira, Dedy Sumardi, Jamhuri, Juhari Hasan, and M. Amir Hm. "Ritual Contestation in Contemporary Acehese Islam: An Ethnography of Fasting and Pilgrimage Practices in Blang Pu'uk, Nagan Raya, Aceh, Indonesia." *El-Usrah* 8, no. 2 (2025): 1254-72. <https://doi.org/10.22373/ujhk.v8i2.27103>.  
<https://doi.org/10.22373/ujhk.v8i2.27103>
- Nasriah, St, Audah Mannan, Herman, Kasjim Salenda, and Andi Ridwan. "Negotiating Sharia Ethics in Paid Hotel Da'wah: A Phenomenological Study of Generation Z in Makassar." *El-Usrah* 9, no. 1 (2026): 329-45. <https://doi.org/10.22373/ujhk.v9i1.32943>.  
<https://doi.org/10.22373/ujhk.v9i1.32943>
- Nugraha, Aa Willy, and Shafinar Ismail. "Understanding Pilgrim Satisfaction: The Role of Customer Experience and Bonus Pack in Umrah Travel." *Journal of Islamic Economic Laws* 8, no. 2 (2025): 65-80. <https://doi.org/10.23917/jisel.v8i02.9969>.  
<https://doi.org/10.23917/jisel.v8i02.9969>
- Nurhayati, N., N. Nurhilaliyah, Siti Hawa Lubis, Sriati Usman, Andi Anira, and Gabriel Anto D. Durrotunnisa. "Enhancing Children's English Vocabulary through Religious Singing Activities in the Era 4.0." *Journal of Ecohumanism* 3, no. 3 (2024): 1832-37. <https://doi.org/10.62754/joe.v3i3.3584>.  
<https://doi.org/10.62754/joe.v3i3.3584>
- Otto, Rudolf. *The Idea of the Holy: An Inquiry into the Non-Rational Factor in the Idea of the Divine and Its Relation to the Rational*. Translated by John W. Harvey. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1923.
- Paloutzian, Raymond F., and Crystal L. Park. "The Psychology of Religion and Spirituality: How Big the Tent?" *Psychology of Religion and Spirituality* 13, no. 1 (2021): 3-13. <https://doi.org/10.1037/rel0000218>.  
<https://doi.org/10.1037/rel0000218>
- Papakostas, Christos. "Faith in Frames: Constructing a Digital Game-Based Learning Framework for Religious Education." *Teaching Theology and Religion* 27, no. 4 (2024): 137-54. <https://doi.org/10.1111/teth.12685>.  
<https://doi.org/10.1111/teth.12685>
- Pirol, Abd. *Komunikasi dan Dakwah Islam*. Yogyakarta: Deepublish, 2018.
- Rahmanawati, Festa Yumpi, M. A. Subandi, and Akif Khilmiyah. "Exploration of Inner Resources in Religious Experience of Muslim Family Caregivers for Autistic Children in Indonesia." *The International Journal of Religion and Spirituality in Society* 13, no. 1 (2022): 1-15. <https://doi.org/10.18848/2154-8633/CGP/v13i01/1-15>.  
<https://doi.org/10.18848/2154-8633/CGP/v13i01/1-15>

- Ridwan, M., Sulaeman, Evy Savitri Gani, Hardianti Yusuf, and Anasufi Banawi. "Experience of the Muslim Community Resistance during COVID-19 in Moluccas, Indonesia." *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities* 30, no. 4 (2022): 1991-2011. <https://doi.org/10.47836/pjssh.30.4.27>
- Steinbock, Anthony J. *Phenomenology and Mysticism: The Verticality of Religious Experience*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2007. <https://doi.org/10.2979/4863.0>
- Sucipto. "Umrah sebagai Gaya Hidup, Eksistensi Diri dan Komoditas Industri: Menyaksikan Perubahan Keagamaan Warga Kota." *Kontekstualita: Jurnal Penelitian Sosial Keagamaan* 28, no. 1 (2013).
- Syamsurijal, Sharyn Davies, Muhammad Irfan Syuhudi, Muhammad Nur Khoiron, Halimatusa'diah, Nensia, and Samsul Maarif. "Trans People Making the Hajj to Mecca: Religiosity and Social Inclusion in Indonesia." *Indonesia and the Malay World* 51, no. 151 (2023): 348-63. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13639811.2023.2287861>
- Tahom, Utis, and Thongchai Srisophon. "Religious Ideology Trends in the Eyes of the New Generation: Conflict, Reinterpretation, and Faith-Based Discrimination." *Human Behavior, Development and Society* 26, no. 3 (2025): 487-501. <https://doi.org/10.62370/hbds.v26i3.280842>
- Tavory, Iddo, and Daniel Winchester. "Experiential Careers: The Routinization and De-Routinization of Religious Life." *Theory and Society* 41, no. 4 (2012): 351-73. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11186-012-9170-z>
- Yusuf, G. T. P., and P. K. Putri. "Gratitude as an Affective Foundation of Religiosity: Evidence from Indonesian Majelis Taklim Communities." *Journal of Educational, Health and Community Psychology* 15, no. 1 (2026): 216-28. <https://doi.org/10.12928/jehcp.vi.31446>